Highlights

Framing (anti-)racism and (in-)tolerance: public issues and denunciations in the news

Portugal

'There are no simplifications, there is conviction': racism and the Media in Portugal

Julia Suárez-Krabbe

Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra (CES/UC)

- Research focused on the role of the Media in the construction of public issues and denunciations of racism, in making racism visible as a key social problem, and the issue framing effects on agenda-setting in institutions and civil society organisations.
- The analysis shows that the Media in Portugal do not make racism visible as a
 political technology that is, as specific practices of governing populations ethncally
 marked. Even though some of the salient elements of racism as a political
 technology are addressed, they are not conceptualised as such. Instead, they are
 presented as sporadic and coincidental events that are not connected.
- The analysis showed that in this category of news items, racism is merely described as *individual prejudice* and few news items fleetingly mention 'institutional racism'; this is consistent with the understanding of racism as an aberration and it implies that it may occur in *some* institutions. Thus the way the concept of institutional racism is understood turns structural issues into specific and isolated problems that are found only in a few institutions, rather than something that structures the everyday functioning of these institutions.
- Regarding Media representations of cases of segregation of the Roma/Gypsy population, the internationally/nationally-focused items represented the Roma/Gypsy population as voiceless victims without agency, and as people 'outside' Europe, 'outside' history, and socially unfit. The news items that reported specific cases of segregation applied a dominant perspective to the problem, and constructed the segregation of the Roma/Gypsy population as a problem pertaining more to misunderstandings between the majority population and the Roma/Gypsies than the structural and institutional practices of social exclusion and segregation. Finally the news items which reported criminal acts committed by Roma/Gypsy individuals. In contrast to the news items dealing with segregation, these reports are characterised by their emphasis on the 'severity' of the facts (criminal acts).

- The research that focused on the ways in which experts journalists, legal authorities and scholars interpret the problems of racism and the Media, and the extent to which links and connections are made between frames (definitions, issue framing, conceptualisations) and specific cases of racism, such as the segregation of the Roma/Gypsy population, showed that the experts operate with an inadequate appreciation of racism, in which racism seems to exist insofar as someone voices it as a kind of paranoia in the minds of susceptible citizens, or an easy pretext for making an otherwise nonexistent case. This appreciation is often coupled with the idea of a subtle racism, an idea closely connected to the denial of racism.
- The idea of *subtle* racism concurs with the view that racism is a *pathological* behaviour, and not a constitutive political technology of the state. The ideas of the experts on news objectivity and newsworthiness concur with this idea of *subtle* racism. Thus, any attempt at addressing the structural elements of racism is deemed biased. Finally, due to an inadequate appreciation of racism, the experts proved unable to make any connections between frames and cases.

General conclusions:

- The combination of the denial of racism, the idea of 'subtle' racism, and the idea of objectivity and newsworthiness produces a narrative in the Media, and among experts, which banalises racism.
- The material analysed showed that different social actors express and practice racism by participating in the misrecognition of the problem by deploying the socially more acceptable *historicist racism* (Goldberg, 2006) framed in terms of culture and development.
- The analysis showed that white privilege is tacitly accepted. As a consequence, racism is attributed to the victims and exists only to the extent that someone voices it.

Denmark

Analysis of Danish Media setting and framing of Muslims, Islam and racism

Sara Jul Jacobsen, Tina Gudrun Jensen, Kathrine Vitus, Kristina Weibel

The Danish Centre for Social Research (SFI)

• Research shows that a subtle form of racism exists in the reporting on ethnic issues and that the Danish Media are among the most critical towards Muslims and Islam compared with the Media in a number of other Western countries. Also, the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) has on several occasions pointed to the role of the Danish Media in creating negative images of ethnic minorities and in contributing to a general climate of intolerance and discrimination against minorities, Muslims in particular. In this light, the purpose of this case study was to analyse *how* Muslims and Islam were represented in Danish newspapers and the *role* the Media plays in the reproduction of racial and ethnic inequalities. The analysis was based on a two month monitoring of four Danish newspapers; 2 broadsheet papers (*Politiken* and *Jyllands-Posten*), 1 tabloid (*EkstraBladet*) and 1 niche paper (*KristeligtDagblad*) between mid-October and mid-December 2011.

- The investigation covered approximately 300 articles on Muslims and Islam and 40 on the representation of racism and discrimination in Danish newspapers. The issue of Muslims and Islam was most intensively covered by Jyllands-Posten, which accounts for almost half of the news stories registered. In the overall coverage, over half of the news stories dealing with Muslims and Islam were negatively framed and restricted to certain kinds of topics such as extremism, terror, sharia, freedom of speech and women's rights. At the same time, other topics occurred much less, such as the social, cultural and economic contribution of Muslims to Danish society, the everyday life of the vast majority of Muslims, and discrimination and racism against Muslims. The negative stories commonly presented Muslim culture and Islam as a threat to democracy, Christianity, freedom of speech and/or Danish values, contributing to a perception of an antagonistic and hierarchical relation between 'Danes' and Muslims', where Muslims and Islam are associated with oppression, religious fanatism, anti-secularism and terrorism. This relatively negative portrayal of the 'other' as problematic, different and uncivilised not only sustains a production and reproduction of stereotypes and prejudices about the 'other', but also indirectly an enactment and reproduction of racism.
- Looking at the news stories about Muslims and Islam abroad, about half were neutral, another half were negative, and almost none provided a positive image of Muslims and Islam. Despite a relatively large share of neutral articles, the overall priority given to certain topics provided a negative representation of Muslims and Islam. Furthermore, negative stories dealing with, for example, extremism, sharia and women's oppression in the Middle East served as a frightening picture of the future in Denmark with the spread of Islam.
- The analysis of the Media coverage of Muslims and Islam also showed that the reporting tended to be rather one-sided and exclusive of minority voices, and in cases where Muslims were given a voice, the same few actors were heard, the 'vocal and visible'. At the same time the lives and opinions of the less visible majority of Muslims were more or less absent in the Media coverage. We also found that Muslim sources were included and quoted in news stories primarily when they were critical of Islam, at the same time as being absent in Islam-neutral or -positive stories, or when the reported actions were not categorised as *Muslim* actions.
- The analysis of the newspaper dealing with issues of racism and discrimination in the four Danish newspapers showed that the newspapers generally avoided using the term 'racism', which reflects the highly contested position of racism in Denmark

in political and public opinion. The journalists tended to use lighter concepts such as 'inequality', or positive terms with a negative prefix such as 'lacking equality' and 'lacking equal rights'. The stories appeared to silence racism or discrimination against ethnic minority groups. Those stories that dealt with racism referred exclusively to blacks in the US or other countries or to Nazism and neo-Nazism: that is, constructed racism as isolated instances and exceptions rather than embedded in social structures and reproduced in social practice. Furthermore, several stories were about `reverse´ racism, in which ethnic minorities (often Muslims) acted in a discriminating and racist manner against Christians, Jews, non-practicing Muslims, women and homosexuals. Most of these articles referred more or less directly to Islam as an ideological and religious threat to society.

France

Framing racism and intolerance: public issues and denunciations in France. The case of 'quotas of discrimination' in French football

Pauline Vermeren

European University Viadrina (EUV)

- On April 30th 2011, the online magazine *Médiapart* published a discussion recorded on November 8th 2010 by the French Federation of Football (FFF), in which the creation of quotas for the young binational players was mentioned. The journalistic accounts, scientific analyses as well as responses from activists and politicians have for the most part called these discourses discriminatory and racist, leading to a scandal in civil society.
- Two databases have been constituted in order to collect journalistic documents: the first is concerned with the scandal surrounding the discriminatory quotas in French football and studies press articles and TV and radio programmes gathered between April and June 2011; the second database is composed of press articles and TV and radio programmes on the theme of racism, discrimination and immigration as well as reports on racist and xenophobic facts and policies in France. They were collected between the 5th and the 19th of December 2011 in the context of the presidential campaign.
- Research accomplished tries to give an account of the convergence of logics between the legal notion (nationality) and the racial appreciation (the fact of being 'Black'). The versatility of the linguistic registers, being implicitly accepted and recognised by everyone.
- Reactions came mainly left wing-oriented Media, giving an impression of a clear positioning within the anti-racist fight. However, a disagreement remains in the analysis regarding the accusation of 'racism' (Should we or should we not speak about racism in this case? How should we speak about racism?).

• Two axes have been chosen: a postcolonial reading based on the triptych 'race'/nation/sport: the discrepancy between the socio-racial situations of the leaders (white and bourgeois) and the players (for the most part with an immigrant background and from the working class) create a greater distance between the decision makers and those who represent the nation.; the logic of economy masking that of racism (efficiency of the strategy in football: selection of players, position in the team, cost of the players, etc.), which points to an institutionalisation of racism beyond individual prejudices.

Italy

Framing racism and intolerance: public issues and denunciations in Italy. Chasing the Gypsy, immolating the Gypsy, securing the city

Simona Pagano

European University Viadrina (EUV)

- Roma living in so-called Nomad Camps are a major topic in local news politics and 'social affairs' sections. They are mentioned mostly in the context of criminal events and campaigns to evict so-called illegal camps and are framed either as a 'problem', or as 'victims' or as 'agents'. Their characterization as problems follows a long-lasting pattern in the relationship between Roma and non-Roma. Framing Roma as 'victims' is relatively 'new' and emerged in the last 50 years. Depicting the Roma as agents is very rare and found mostly in correlation with the 'victim' or 'problem' frame.
- Our data collection revealed that the majority (approx.1/3) of the news items in our case study concerning the 'Nomad Plan' shape hostility, while the other 2/3 are either inclusive or neutral. In our second case concerning the camp raid in Turin the news reports are either neutral or inclusive. We have found no inclusive article in the right-wing newspaper 'II Tempo' in contrast to some inclusive items in centre-right newspapers 'La Stampa' and 'II Messagero'. News reports shaping hostility were found across the whole ideological spectrum. Language is more explicit in the (centre-)right newspapers. As a voice of minority agents, Roma are quoted in rare cases and exclusively in the (centre-)left newspapers.
- Roma were depicted mostly as a problem. Allusions to their precarious living conditions, unstable or non-existent work opportunities, failure to attend school, criminality, and 'illegal' housing were the recurrent themes, found in every newspaper. They were depicted as victims mostly in (centre-) left newspapers. The above-mentioned themes are then represented in another way, making the Roma victims of their current situation and slipping then into victimization discourses. The victim/perpetrator model however, is hegemonial and stabilizes the domination

structure. Occasionally, some news reported Roma agency in protests and demonstrations. This was rare and set against an 'Italian' expert opinion.

 Racism was not mentioned in the first case. In the second case news reported racism. Analogously to our other reports, racism was considered as an individual phenomenon and in this specific case as an exceptional reaction by a specific part of the population. In fact, it was stressed that the pogrom had nothing to do with civilized, cultured and Christian society. Racism was also seen as offending against 'Italian' mainstream society rather than against the Roma.

Germany

The Media and Muslims in Germany

Hakan Tosuner

European University Viadrina (EUV)

- Today, news coverage on Muslims and Islam occupies an important place in the German Media. The coverage is mainly sensationalist, stereotypical, and hostile. Islam is mainly confined to conflict-ridden issues, such as violence, terrorism, fundamentalism, backwardness, honour killings, oppression of women, and forced marriages. On the basis of a dichotomous binary worldview, Muslims are represented as a homogenous entity, hence portrayed as the 'other' and a threat to the West.
- The four monitored newspapers encompassed both a large ideological spectrum and the most influential mainstream newspapers in Germany. In the monitoring period from September to December 2011 around 80 percent of the items covered international issues, and around 10 percent national or local issues. National news items dealt with issues such as terrorism/Islamism, Islamophobia, education, German-Turkish relations and forced marriages.
- In this report we have decided to analyse the news coverage on forced marriages. Firstly, with 25 news items – constituting about one quarter of all national news items related to Islam or Muslims – it offered a sufficient set of data, and, secondly, all four newspapers covered this subject. The left-liberal FR published seven news items on the issue of forced marriages, while the conservative FAZ, the rightconservative die Welt, and the liberal SZ published three, eleven and four news items respectively. From the analysis of the news articles one can conclude that 19 items were hostile, three were inclusive, and three neutral. Regardless of ideological orientation of the newspaper, the portrayal of Muslims in the German Media is predominantly hostile, stigmatizing, and exclusive. However, it is notable that the conservative papers tend to be more exclusive and hostile towards the 'other' Muslim than the liberal-left.

- Muslim women were represented as powerless and voiceless victims of forced marriages, in urgent need of empowerment and emancipation. Their dramatic fate is reduced to the culture and religion of their parents' country of origin. Partially, due to Muslim women's presumed deficient integration, i.e. for not being able to speak German, their situation is even presented as self-inflicted.
- Even though many minority voices were represented, with the exception of one, they were all framed negatively. It was mainly victims of forced marriages who were quoted, who reduced their negative experience to their culture and the religion of Islam. Through this act the minority voices take on the role of a crown witness and the impression is created that they give a voice to a collective of innumerable silenced victims. In the context of anti-Muslim racism the crown witnesses' function is twofold: firstly, the effect of the negative and personal experiences do morally immunise the victims from accusations of racism and, secondly, legitimize (the majority society's) anti-Muslim resentments.
- Muslim men, be it in the role of the father, brother or husband, are portrayed as the violent and barbaric aggressors of forced marriage. They are solidified in their patriarchic-fundamentalist mentality and the impression is created that for the protection of honour they are determined to go to any extreme, such as humiliating, beating up, and even killing women.

Spain (Basque Country)

The 'other' in Education: Media representations of foreign immigrants and Gypsies in Basque Schools

Daniel Muriel

Collective Identity Researh Centre, University of the Basque Country (CEIC/UPV)

- The central theme followed in this workpackage has been education. We have concentrated on the Media material that, in the press, mentioned education with respect to the selected target population: the Roma and foreign immigrant population.
- The content on education in the Basque Country during the last two years (2010 and 2012) has been monitored in five newspapers: *El Correo*, a moderate-conservative newspaper with a local character; *El Diario Vasco*, a newspaper belonging to the same group as *El Correo*, published in the Basque province of Guipúzcoa; El País, a progressive newspaper published at the national level; *Deia*, a Basque nationalist newspaper with a conservative character; *Gara*, a left-wing Basque nationalist newspaper, published at the local level and with a greater presence of *Euskera*.

- The Roma collective has space available to it in the press in which it can speak directly. The main problem that is articulated in the Media with respect to the Gypsy community refers to the process of ghettoization: they tend to concentrate in the same schools, which still employ model A (Spanish only) and in very specific neighbourhoods. Although the press seems to reflect that this problem refers to a question of a structural type, due to which the Roma have traditionally been marginalized, there is also a strong representation of this community that makes them responsible for their own exclusion: their marginalization in the field of education is explicable in terms of internal problems inherent to themselves.
- With respect to the press treatment of foreign immigrants and their relation to education, they rarely have a direct presence through their own voice. The greatest representation concerning this situation corresponds to the space provided to the discourse of the government institutions. In these news items a connection is now made between foreign immigrant children and a problem that must be dealt with specifically, in terms of manageability.
- To a large extent the immigrant is held responsible for her own situation of marginalization in the schools, since although the Education Department attempts to avoid their concentration, it is the immigrants themselves who form groups again. Not only is the immigrant collective itself held to be responsible for its situation, but moreover it is represented as excessively vulnerable: these images in the press are at the same time mixed with recognition of their precarious situation together with a stereotyped image of them as an ignorant collective with few resources, which leads them to take decisions resulting in their self-exclusion.
- The institutional discourse reflected by the press often rests on the idea of labour power or pocket of biological replacement, that is, immigration as a useful resource for being able to maintain the level of life and development of Basque society and for ensuring its reproduction.
- Following the public institutions, there are certain claims and actions proceeding from civil society (parents' associations, neighbourhood associations, associations related to the education of children and adolescents, NGOs, etc.) that have most presence in the press. In this case, a narrative is produced that describes the magnanimity with which the autochthonous population deals with the problem of education and immigration, which to a certain extent also permits a certain condescension of the host society towards the immigrant to show through, although in any case this is done while always stressing the initiative of the community as an example of managing a situation of marginalization.
- The press does not always reflect initiatives in favour of the inclusion of the 'other' by the receptor society, but also, less frequently, stress is placed on its hostility and rejection of what is different, which is situated in the field of destructuring and marginalization.

- One of the issues with the most impact in the press in the last two years has been that of unaccompanied minors. Disputes are visualized that encompass both the most hostile representations towards these minors – who are often accused of lying about their age and of committing more offences than other social groups – as well as more inclusive ones – in which their being abandoned and the conditions of precariousness in which they live are denounced. It is the narrative of a double suspicion that is narrated through concrete cases: suspicion of foreign immigrants even though they are minors, and of the institutions that have to take charge of them.
- Finally, with less presence but with a certain relevance, different studies can be found that contain data on racism and the rejection of the 'other' in schools. In general, it can be said that what stands out in the press is a non-problematic image of Basque schools, in which the immigrants do not feel themselves to be subjected to marginalization or xenophobic actions, although space is given to studies that determine that racism is growing in the classrooms with the increase of foreign immigrants.

Spain (Andalusia)

Digital press discourses and representations on immigration, Islam and immigrant students in Andalusia

Ángeles Castaño Madroñal, Iván Periáñez Bolaño

Research Group for the Study of Sociocultural Identities in Andalusia, University of Seville (GEISA/US)

- Within the news that focus on immigration issues, the tendency to homogenisation and reduction, and the priority given to news referring to means of control of fluxes, border surveillance, and clandestine arrivals in pateras, work together to build up the stereotype of the 'illegal immigrant'. The migratory phenomenon is shown to be potentially dangerous and destabilising; it is represented as an imperceptible 'invasion' from northern Africa. This representation affects the idea of Andalusia as the 'border zone with Africa' within the Spanish state and as the 'southern border of Europe'. Muslim groups are defined as essentially different from a cultural perspective, the 'other' who cannot be integrated, and which is perceived as violent and threatening to western Christian identity.
- The news on the presence of mosques in Andalusian towns show a discourse dominated by Islamophobia and the fear of criminality, fundamentalism and Islamic terrorism. A clear relationship is drawn between Islam, sexist violence, and the fanaticism of 'jihadist' groups. Through a racist discourse which recurrently mentions religious symbols (Imam, mosque, Quran) while describing in detail antisocial acts

committed by members of the group as if they were collective attributes, these representations provoke negative emotional reactions against those individuals carrying Islamic symbols or showing Islamic traits. Mosques are thus rejected as spatial markers which potentially stigmatise their urban environment.

- The news focused on the presence of immigrant students in Andalusian schools are dominated by a proactive political discourse on the educational policies carried out by the regional government. We have shown that this discourse is regulated, due to its political relevance and social implications, and controlled, regarding access. This does not prevent the articles from filtering the students' diversity through reductionist and homogenising categories and, occasionally, even through exclusive reactive discourses. Additionally, most articles combine reactive and preventive discourses on a diversity perceived as a potential threat which must be, therefore, corrected to the balance and quality of the educative system. Regarding the management of educational policies, the focus is set on the hard work of institutions and teachers.
- These connected ideas in Media discourses promote an implicit imagination with enormous collective force, which constructs the phenomenon of immigration and its manifestations as 'invasion', shaping the reactive discourse against immigration. These discourses have effects in the activation of fundamentalist discourses towards the defence of national fortresses, with strong racist roots, while making preferential use of the immigration argument.
- We have pointed to the importance of examining the Media discourse as a factor in the generation of public opinion, political discourses and the power relationships they declare, and the underlying ideologies that the Media discourses contribute to disseminate. We have also shown how the Media discourses on immigration and cultural diversity in Andalusian villages and schools are biased by discriminatory discourses, the stated impossibility of integrating Muslim groups, and notions of invasion, threat and social instability.
- These journalistic discourses on immigrants are generated in socio-economic structures, which functionally breed ideological frameworks and power relations and they must be analysed as cultural results subjected to the socio-historical contexts in which they are articulated. In this sense, they become fully-fledged political issues as soon as they are generated in productive structures that are subjected to the context of construction of new referents for an imagined supra-national identity (Anderson, 1983), i.e. the Europeanness in the EU's context.
- We share the thesis that in globalised societies, mediated communication acquires a central role in the construction of everyday life, as producer of meaning within shared cultural frameworks (Cocco, 2003: 51) and as transmitter of collective representations (Spitulnik, 1993). Therefore, these discourses should be contextualized as producers of meaning for racism in Europe.

United Kingdom

The Media and Muslims in the UK

Katy Sian, Ian Law, Salman Sayyid

Centre for Ethnicity and Racism Studies, University of Leeds (CERS/ULeeds)

- Muslims and Islam have occupied a central role in the British Media following the Salman Rushdie Affair, the 2001 riots, conflicts in the Middle East and the global war on terror. Featuring also in issues surrounding multiculturalism, crime, education and faith schools, immigration, and oppressed women linked to the Burqa debate, Muslims have been the focus of numerous public issues and denunciations.
- From our data collection the results indicated that 70 percent of all the news items gathered were hostile; 15 percent were inclusive; and 15 percent neutral. Additionally when examining the strength of minority news actors voices we found that 80 percent of the items represented no voice, 10 percent represented a medium voice, 5 percent a weak voice and 5 percent represented a strong voice. From the four papers analysed it is clear that negative, Islamophobic and defamatory constructs of Muslims in relation to terrorism are hegemonic. The *Daily Mail* and *The Sun* published the most number of stories related to the issue and were the most discriminatory, and more than often jingoistic, in their framing, imagery and language.
- The representations of Muslims were hostile which facilitated the development of public hysteria and an overwhelming sense of fear by insisting that terrorists are 'lurking' on the streets of Britain, and furthermore there was a tendency to evoke that a 'terrorist' attack could be imminent. The recurring use of words such as 'fanatic', 'terrorist', 'fundamentalist', 'radical' and 'extremist' by *The Sun, The Independent* and the *Daily Mail*, works to stamp and imprint a particular image of the Muslim 'other' or more specifically the Muslim 'enemy'.
- In relation to representations of Muslims surrounding the issue of grooming, abuse and madrassas, there appeared to be a clear hegemonic focus on the 'dangerous Muslim male' construct. Muslims in the news items around these topics were largely vilified, hyper-sexualised and racialised.
- In the case of the Muslim 'gang attack' on a white woman during the 2011 riots, both *The Sun* and the *Daily Mail* gave this story a great degree of space, however in the case of 'alleged' police racism/Islamophobia, this item only received a very small amount of column inch space, which reinforces Van Dijk's argument surrounding the denial of racism in the tabloid press. The larger coverage of the Muslim 'attack' seems to imply that this had more significance, what makes this interesting is that the victim was white, however in the case of the black victim very little space or coverage was given and the issue was trivialised.

- The issue of 'forced' marriages and immigration generated a lot of Media attention, largely from the tabloid press. The general framing of these issues was constructed as largely 'problematic' and a strain and hindrance to Britain.
- Our findings demonstrated that immigration was perhaps the largest site for racist expression to be vocalised by the right wing press. Subjects were racially marked, criminal acts and strange practices and customs emphasised as well as the burden on Britain's resources, thus the national majority was constructed as the injured party, where as immigrants were largely represented as freeloading criminals.
- Muslims were over-represented in the forced marriage 'scandal' whereby they were read through an orientalist and largely cultural lens thus perpetuating the framework of backwards/modern and oppressive/free etc. Muslims were also tied up in stories relating to 'foreign' criminal activity, thus they were constructed as representing a fundamental 'threat' to the well being of the country.
- The maintenance of such negative and vilifying expressions manifested through the *Daily Mail, The Sun* and *The Independent,* excludes and marginalises Muslim voices which are limited if not invisibilised, additionally there is a propensity to homogenise Muslims, the consequence of this being that Islamophobia remains unchallenged.
- Our findings expose the hegemony of Islamophobia in the majority of the newspapers examined. Although *The Sun*, the *Daily Mail* and *The Independent* all constructed Muslims in a largely negative light, this was illustrated more so by the tabloid press. This can be seen to reflect the wider social, public and political discourses surrounding Muslims as fundamentally 'problematic', representing the 'enemy' of the west. Alongside this we also can identify post-racial logics at play whereby issues of racism are trivialised, denied or in some cases exceptionalised.
- The Guardian was the only paper that offered a more critical and balanced account in representations of Muslims, thus can be seen to represent a counter-hegemonic discourse. Avoiding stereotypes, racial markers and distortion, it was the most impartial and inclusive of all the papers analysed. Illustrating positive moves in representations of Muslims, overall *The Guardian* tended to provide a more fair, critical and balanced approach, and also, in January this year, published and supported a campaign calling for an inquiry into anti-Islam press.