

Introduction

November 2011

The texts in this compilation bring together the results of the second phase of the TOLERACE project: 'The geography of (anti)racism and tolerance: local policy responses, discrimination and employment'. The purpose of this second phase was to make a comparative analysis of cultural diversity and the discourses on (anti)racism and tolerance that can be deduced from social integration policies, based on empirical research in different local contexts defined by each of the groups participating in the project. There are nine texts that describe and analyze as many cases dealt with by the teams that form part of the TOLERACE project: Portugal, Denmark, France, Germany, Italy, the United Kingdom, the Basque Country and Andalusia (the last two as differentiated settings within the Spanish state). Each of the cases is focused on the field of work and employment, and pays attention to three concrete aims: analysis of the role played by local mediation agents (e.g. city councils; community organizations; immigrant grassroots organizations); identification of vulnerability towards racism and discrimination of certain 'populations'; and practices and conceptions of racist discrimination, not so much as a structural political problem – although to a large extent it is – but taking the form of particular 'incidents' that occur in specific settings in relation to populations considered to be 'problematic'.

Three aspects therefore traverse the set of texts collected here: the role of local mediation agents in social integration policies; the vulnerability to, and risk of discrimination of certain social groups; and the effect of local (anti)racist policies on the conceptualization of racism. The same general framework of understanding informs the text on each particular context: research in (anti)racism needs to deal with its meanings, its semantics and its deepest reasons. These reasons are related to the diversity of national construction processes and the post-colonial situations of European states, rather than to the level of individual attitudes towards difference. The latter approach guides the majority of contemporary focuses on the question, and this frequently generates an order of governmentality (Hesse, 2004) that perpetuates

certain populations in the place of the minority, thus reproducing difference and, based on this, discrimination and stigmatising behaviour. The intention to inquire in this manner into the semantics of these social processes places each of the texts collected here within a critical perspective, from which the discourses and political interventions that procure 'cohesion', 'integration' or social 'inclusion' of the groups most *vulnerable* to racism are analysed.

Thus, in the articles that make up this compilation, the reader is not going to find a mass of statistical data that offers a quantitative characterization of diversity and, based on that, of certain supposed 'racial relations', obtained by measuring the attitudes of majorities towards minorities (in this way frequently reproducing, legitimizing and stabilizing such attitudes without really intending to do so) in order to outline a sociological panorama from that way of understanding racism and tolerance. On the contrary, following the initial premises of TOLERACE, the purpose of each of the articles is to replace '*the problematics of empirical testing of racial attitudes and aptitudes with analyses of the body of discourse concerning race and racism*' (Goldberg, 1992: xiii). It is therefore a question of results and analyses arising from research with a qualitative character, aimed at contributing understanding on the historical and structural genesis of racism and antiracist policies of integration in the employment field in each particular context. The scientific validation of the texts is thus based on case studies that, for reasons that each research team makes clear in its respective report, are considered 'paradigmatic' (Flyvbjerg, 2004), that is, cases that make it possible to highlight the more general characteristics of the societies studied, and to make a sociological reading of the social problems that these societies pose.

The common life-sphere observed in each of the 'cases' studied is that of work and employment. A critical analysis is made there of the local policies directed at the integration of those populations considered *vulnerable* to racial discrimination. Different aspects or functions of work as a social sphere are dealt with by the research presented here, and their special relevance in these social processes is indicated in all the cases. In the majority of texts work appears as an instance of fundamental socialization that orders life and social relations, and it is an indicator of the degree of people's affiliation or disaffiliation (the Basque Country and France). Work is also frequently conceived as a social value that activates social categorizations and classifications that are related to vulnerability and favour the generation of stigmas depending on its exercise or its lack (the United Kingdom, Germany, the Basque Country and Denmark). In other cases, work is understood to be a field of relations and

encounter with the 'other' and, as such, as a space of coexistence; but one that is also given to the generation of 'incidents', in which certain corrective public policies intervene (Portugal, the United Kingdom, Germany and Denmark). Finally, work is understood as the labour market and, in this way, as a field of differences that respond to historical and structural reasons that are not always evident to the public discourses and policies implemented: collective tendencies in the distribution of work, differentiated assignment of tasks and trades according to 'racial marks'; inequalities in remuneration and in the provision and exercise of certain rights of the working person, etc. (Andalusia, the Basque Country, France, Germany, the United Kingdom and Denmark).

The conclusions on which the texts are in agreement can be summed up in the following points:

- **The rationale and implementation of the public policies analysed show a clear process of constructing specific populations and subjects as 'others', focusing on their 'problematic characteristics' and rendering the discussion on racism and anti-racist approaches marginal or even irrelevant.** Policies on 'inclusion' and 'employability' are becoming a question of social assistance, with the agents in charge of implementing them (e.g. local authorities, NGOs, local public servants) seeing their work as aiming at the 'correction' of the perceived *deficits* in the populations' characteristics, culture or values that would constrain their integration in the labour market (i.e. 'backward' cultural practices, 'passivity', 'unrealistic expectations' or 'unwillingness' to integrate).
- **Immigrants and the Roma/Gypsy population are the two great categories of 'others' referred to – and in this way they are reified as such – by the public policies inscribed in the field of work.** They are, therefore, the groups that are most vulnerable to racial discrimination. Amongst the former it is possible to discover a whole gradation of stigma, with the Moslem population situated in the most severe position. It could be said that this constitutes a 'radical other' on the basis of minimal and quotidian distinctive signs, like the use of the veil in women, which are related to deep cultural differences inscribed in the religious order (the United Kingdom, Germany and Denmark). In certain national or regional contexts (Portugal, Andalusia and the Basque Country), the Gypsy population appears as the 'eternal other', the object of policies of inclusion

of a civilisatory type, aimed at developing certain patterns of behaviour that are presumed to be suitable to, characteristic of, or normal in the 'greater society'. In any case, the political discourse and interventions founded on the principles of inclusion/integration of ethnically marked minorities (including immigration amongst these) reproduce conceptions about a clear distinction between a national society free of any distinctive ethnic signs, and different ethnically marked minorities that must, 'naturally', make their own efforts in order to achieve their inclusion/integration. Thus, 'the problem of integration' – transferred in this case to the labour market, to the field of work, or to access to palliative assistance in the event of its lack (the Basque Country, Andalusia, the United Kingdom, Germany and Denmark) – concerns people belonging to the 'minoritised' groups themselves.

- The **weakening of anti-racism policies and legislation to protect racialised groups via the tackling of racist structures and practices in the process of recruitment and professional training is replaced by a strong discourse on difference, diversity and identity.** The deployment of such discourse on difference legitimizes the 'unsuccessful' inclusion of immigrants/minorities in the labor market and their 'unfitness' for living among 'us', whereas their 'presence' as guest-workers – assumed as temporary – is seen as less problematic for not threatening assumed forms of political belonging and the presumed original homogeneity of the 'autochthonous' population.

In any case, work always appears as a fundamental sphere for social life, especially expressed in the definition and categorizations of the 'other' and, consequently, of the circumstantial We from which such categorizations emanate as well. This is a dialectical process with a collective character and, as such, to a significant extent it superimposes itself on, and determines the individual attitude to stigmatization and racial discrimination. All the texts presented here are clear in this respect: racism and its ideal palliative – tolerance – involve something more than individual discriminatory behaviour. Their dynamic responds to social mechanisms that are activated due to the effect of the historical clusters that have given shape (and continue to give shape) to the constitution of the We in the European states. The discovery of this collective foundation, even though general and therefore imprecise, is not of minor importance for the TOLERACE project. On the one hand, it indicates to the academic community the

need for superseding that framework of 'post-racist' understanding that, at the same time as individualizing racism, trivializes it when not denying it, sheltered behind the principle of the biological non-existence of races – in many cases ignoring social aspects in the constitution of the idea of 'race'. The call is thus to discover the historical substratum and the political foundations of racism. At the same time – although this is strictly linked to the foregoing – it points to the need for dialogue amongst the academic sector, the political sector and civil society in order to achieve an understanding of greater depth and scope at the level of all the European institutions, making the problem of racism something that concerns the We while making the always controversial question of 'living together' more comprehensive.

References

Flyvbjerg, Bent (2004) 'Five misunderstandings about case-study research' in Clive Seale et al. (eds.), *Qualitative Research Practice*, London and Thousand Oaks: Sage, 420-434.

Goldberg, David T. (2002) 'Modernity, race, and morality', in Philomena Essed and David Goldberg (eds), *Race Critical Theories: Text and Context*, Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 283-306.

Hesse, Barnor (2004) 'Im/Plausible Deniability, Racism's Conceptual Double Bind', *Social Identities*, Vol. 10, No 1, 9-29.

Ethnography of paradigmatic cases at local level

Country/Locality of the case study	Case study	Rationale
<p>Portugal Coimbra</p>	<p>Portuguese state's specific approaches on 'inclusion', anti-racism/anti-discrimination and access to the labour market for the Roma/Gypsies: two projects implemented in the central region of Portugal (Coimbra) by local public bodies and civil society organisation, and funded by national (Programme <i>Choices</i>) and European (EQUAL) schemes.</p>	<p>The ways in which the policy initiatives analysed – framed under the idea of 'employability' and 'activation of competences' – render racism a marginal process that is, <i>as if</i> racism does not affect the <i>effective</i> implementation of those measures.</p> <p>How racism is reproduced and anti-racism marginalised through diverse <i>regimes of denial</i>, which 'accommodate' racism foreclosing a discussion of its historical and structural dimensions.</p>
<p>Denmark Copenhagen</p>	<p>(case 1) Ethnic minority youth at the Danish labour market and the prevalence of racism or discrimination in this regard. The analysis of two projects funded by the municipality.</p> <p>(case 2) Employment conditions for Eastern European migrant workers.</p>	<p>How the debate and policies on integration revolves around values, tradition and culture often based on a notion of the nation state and national identity. The prevalence of a polarization between 'us' and 'them' and the centrality of the issue of exclusion and inclusion.</p> <p>The role of (anti)discrimination, (anti)racism and tolerance as well as discourses on Eastern European migrant workers contributing to legitimizing discrimination against them.</p>
<p>France Paris</p>	<p>The mobilisation of undocumented workers in France/Paris: discrimination and social invisibility. The role of a constellation of actors (associations, trade unions and collectives), providing legal and social support to these workers and lobbying with the government on their behalf.</p>	<p>How the mobilisation of undocumented workers has been related to the issue of representation in public space and how their recruitment is read in terms of economic 'necessity'. The issue of racism remains trapped in the discussion around universal citizenship, a political imaginary in tension with discourses that denunciate the institutionalised xenophobia and racism of the European migration policy.</p>
<p>Germany Berlin</p>	<p>The location of anti-discrimination measures in employment for Muslims and the awareness and problem-framing by policy makers and stakeholders.</p>	<p>The centrality of Islamophobia within the developments in world politics and the debates on terrorism, security, and <i>Islamism</i>. How in this developments the German job market has undergone significant changes leading to a noticeably toughening of the confrontation with Islam in the field of vocational training and employment.</p>
<p>Italy</p>	<p>Integration of Roma communities living in so-called 'nomad camps' into the local job</p>	<p>How Anti-Gypsism is reproduced and legitimised within a vicious circle that</p>

Rome	market, shaped by controversies about the relocation and eviction of Roma people from unauthorised settlements.	comprises precarious housing conditions, exclusion from the labour market and lacking educational opportunities. How the routine governmentality of the life in the 'nomad camp' shapes the understanding of racism against the Roma and the implementation of specific initiatives aimed at their inclusion in the labour market.
Spain (Basque Country) 'Rioja Alavesa' region (Province of Alava)	The emergence/implementation of a series of institutional initiatives that attempt to diagnose, guide, correct or, in any case, influence social relations, trying to bring about a better 'coexistence' and tolerance between the 'autochthonous' population and immigration related to 'seasonal work' and 'settled immigration' in a Southern region of the Basque Country devoted to wine production.	How discourses on 'immigration' related to ideas about their condition as 'temporary' or 'settled' population, activate the representations on alterity and political belonging in the local society. The ways in which mostly undefined ideas on 'multiculturality' and 'interculturality' shape the discussion on racism and anti-racism.
Spain (Andalusia) El Egido (Province of Almeria) Seville	The rationale of public policies for the 'integration' of immigrants in the labour market, shaped by intensive agriculture activities, and their work conditions implemented by local public bodies and civil society organisations. Projects of inclusion in the labour market and professional training for foreign 'immigrant workers' living in a so called 'problematic neighbourhood'.	The location of anti-racist measures and discourses within the broader frame of 'integration' policies in the labour market. How it is perceived the vulnerability to racism of institutions and civil society organizations in their everyday functioning.
United Kingdom Leeds and Leicester	The functioning of public bodies and training activities aimed at managing diversity in the workplace and combating discrimination against Muslims in the workplace.	The way in which the hegemony of liberal ontology affects how anti-discrimination practices in the workplace are carried out within a post-racial framework. How racism has become tied up in a language of ignorance and lack of education or over-sensitivity and trouble making.

Fieldwork: in-depth interviews/focus groups		
Country	Research participants	Total
Portugal	Civil society organisations: NGOs implementing projects on socio-economic inclusion/integration, local Roma grassroots organisation, anti-racist activists, trade unionists, and cultural mediators. Public bodies' representatives: local/national public servants, policy makers and technicians.	19 interviews
Denmark	Civil society organisations: trade unionists, NGOs, immigrants' grassroots associations; young ethnic minority men. Public bodies' representatives: local/national authorities, social workers and social street workers.	Case 1 11 interviews 2 focus groups Case 2 11 interviews 3 focus groups
France	Civil society organisations: undocumented workers' organisations, lawyers' NGOs, trade unionist. Academics	9 interviews
Germany	Civil society organisations: immigrant and ethnic minority organisations, anti-discrimination organisations, employers' associations. Public bodies' representatives: local policy makers and public servants.	13 interviews
Italy	Civil society organisations: anti-racist NGOs, journalists, trade unions, Roma living in the 'nomad-camp'. Academics Public bodies' representatives: local council policy makers and public servants.	20 interviews
Spain-Basque Country	Civil society organisations: trade unionists, anti-racist NGOs, immigrant's grassroots associations Public bodies' representatives: local regional policy makers and public servants, church-based organisations,	18 interviews
Spain - Andalusia	Civil society organisations: NGOs, church-based social organisations, immigrant's grassroots organisations, neighbourhood organisations, trade unionists, entrepreneurs' organisations. Public bodies' representatives: regional/local policy makers, public servants and technicians	42 interviews (in El Egido case study) 32 interviews (in Seville case study)
UK	Civil society organisations: Immigrant's and minority's grassroots organisations, anti-racist NGOs Academics Public bodies' representatives: Regional/National policy makers; local council representatives and public servants Supervisors of Islamic cultural centres	18 interviews