

## **Spain (Andalusia)**

# **The insertion of immigrants in the Andalusian labour market: policies and intervention processes in Seville and El Ejido in comparative perspective**

**Ángeles Castaño Madroñal**

Research Group for the Study of Sociocultural Identities in Andalusia, University of Seville (GEISA/US)

### **Summary**

The research was carried out in Andalusia on the integration processes of immigrant collectives at local level on a comparative perspective between the two case studies: Seville as administrative capital of the Autonomous Community of Andalusia and El Ejido as municipality of the Poniente district, in Almeria province, that is configured as an agro-industrial district.

Our study highlights the immigrants' difficulties in relation with their labour integration and how the panorama of local economic crisis triggered by the context of international financial crisis is affecting them.

We analysed the social processes related to social integration from a perspective that goes beyond the specific situations of racism, xenophobic attitudes and discriminatory practices, but understanding such processes as a set of representations of the 'otherness' that contribute to the 'other's' minorisation, as a thinking style and collective practice of power expressed in the various spheres of social interaction. Another objective of our study is the detection of action protocols and protection mechanisms when facing situations of discrimination, in order to analyse the role of the social organizations in situations of structural vulnerability.

We analysed the labour integration policy of the Junta de Andalucía and the social intervention policy in excluded environments. We also highlight the lack of coordination between these two policies and also between their action mechanisms. The data show the low impact of these policies after a decade of regional immigration policy.

The social processes aiming at the development of activities towards employment, work and income search within the collective networks that are most affected by the crisis must be highlighted. Such activities comprise the development and reactivation of domestic transnational economic strategies between the bordering regions of Andalusia and Morocco.

The procedures and mechanisms to control unemployment benefits fraud are focused in the immigrants' collective who are both unemployed and long term-residents. To the negative effects of the crisis in the immigrants' roots and integration we must add as a contributing factor the institutional action procedures that favour a discriminatory fraud control policy.

### *Proposals*

A change in the Aliens' legislation to introduce considerations for long-term immigrants, thus minimizing the negative impact of the crisis on the family and/or individual integration process and roots.

Structuring and articulating instruments of intervention within the comprehensive policy of the Junta de Andalucía, promoting linkages between the measures and programs that are operating in excluded environments and in environments established for labour integration, in order to favour both a territorial focus and the most precarious collectives.

Undertake a general housing policy for farm workers in Andalusia, with a special emphasis in the eradication of the live conditions below the poverty line and the helplessness of the human rights of migrant workers who are settled in scattered rural settlements in the agro-industrial districts of Poniente and Campo de Níjar in Almeria province.

Enable new democratic and participatory protocols in the procedures to access to public subsidies for social intervention, which may encourage the development of immigrant organizations and mixed networks of organizations. This would favour a greater impact of the social programs on targeted groups.

Promote the integration through the activation of participatory mechanisms to solve local social problems by promoting the full citizenship inclusion of immigrant collectives and the development of a sense of local belonging.

## **Introduction**

Our study is based on a comparative fieldwork, which has been simultaneously conducted in the cities of Seville and El Ejido by a team of five researchers from

October to June 2011. The object of study of this paper is the labour insertion of immigrant collectives in these two municipalities, taking into account both the integration policies related to the labour market and the role played by the intermediary agents. We have addressed, as one of our main objectives, the discourses emerging from the institutions and their agents on integration and discrimination in the local labour market, considering the representations of (anti-)racism and tolerance in this social sphere as a way of approaching the ability of institutions and organizations to eradicate racism and discrimination. We understand the phenomenon beyond specific situations of racism, attitudes of xenophobia and discriminatory practices, but as a set of representations of otherness contributing to the minorization of the 'other' as a thinking style and collective practice of power, that becomes manifest in the various fields of social interaction. Another of our main objectives was the detection of action protocols and protection mechanisms when facing situations of discrimination, in order to analyse the role of the social organizations in cases of structural defencelessness. The integration into the labour market has been studied from a holistic perspective, i.e. we have taken into account the different areas related: rights and legal framework, occupational health, access to housing and the insertion in associative networks and trade unions<sup>1</sup>.

This paper consists of five sections that address the description of the work context and the migration process in Seville and El Ejido; the integration policies and the role of intermediary agents; the current situation of immigrants in the context of crisis triggered by the global financial system, and which is particularly affecting Andalusia in the Spanish State. Finally, we set a series of reflections on the ability of the Andalusian institutions to intervene against racism, while pointing at issues that should be considered as specific measures to lessen the negative social impact of the current economic and demographic policies. The structure of this paper is as follows:

1. The labour market in Seville and El Ejido: sectors for the insertion of immigrants.
2. Integration policies in the Andalusian labour market: contradictions between theory and practice.
3. Situation of non-EU national workers to access their labour rights and the role of intermediary agents in this process.
4. The precariousness of integration in the context of economic crisis.

---

<sup>1</sup> During this intensive and multi-located fieldwork a total of 32 interviews in Seville and 42 in El Ejido have been conducted. We addressed the perspectives of leaders from various immigrant groups, trade union agents, technicians and department heads of the public administrations (at a local, provincial and regional level) and of agents of the most outstanding immigrants and pro-immigrant organizations in both localities. To this fieldwork we added the field data collected through participant and field observations carried out on the different spheres and most approachable organizations.

## 5. A reflection on institutional racism in Andalusia.

The field data collection and the interviews were accomplished in both municipalities between October 2010 and June 2011. Two workshops were held in May 2011, one in El Ejido and another in Seville, with the social and institutional representatives who have contributed to our study. In this workshops the participants discussed and put together the most relevant issues emerging during the fieldwork. The most significant outcomes of both forums in relation to integration in the labour market, the role of social agents and the effects of the implemented policies are gathered in the results set forth in this document.

### **1. The labour market in Seville and El Ejido: sectors for the insertion of immigrants**

The labour markets in Seville and El Ejido are framed by their own local specificities. Both cases are a good example of the socio-economic polarization of the Andalusian territory.

Seville is the capital of the Andalusian autonomous community and it is the Spanish fourth most populated city. Seville is also the heart of a metropolitan conurbation in process of expanding. During the last thirty years, since the establishment of the autonomous communities<sup>2</sup>, a territorialised model of productive specialization has been consolidated in Andalusia, a model that is very difficult to be reversed. From the Andalusian peripheral location in relation to the Spanish State and the European Union, the agri-food production has achieved a central role in certain provinces (Jaen, Cordoba, Almeria and the West Coast of Huelva), while other provinces such as Malaga, Seville, Granada and Cadiz have developed a thriving service sector related to tourism in the city capitals and in the population centres along the coastline. In the case of Seville city, as it is the provincial and regional capital, has an important amount of public employment<sup>3</sup> related to the three public administrations (Andalusian Government-*Junta de Andalucía*, Seville Provincial Council-*Diputación provincia* and Seville City Council-*Ayuntamiento*) with a total of 120.806 public

---

<sup>2</sup> The *Estatuto de Autonomía* is the Spanish basic institutional norm of each Autonomous Community, recognized by the 1978 Spanish Constitution in its Article 147. The Spanish state is organized in autonomous communities since 1978. Andalusia accessed its autonomous status by a referendum held on February 28, 1981.

<sup>3</sup> At the beginning of this decade, public services contributed with 20% of the metropolitan area GDP (Source: *Plan Estratégico Sevilla 2010*). In 2005, the service sector -public and private- occupied about 80% of the metropolitan employment (Source: *Barómetro de Economía Urbana. Sevilla Global. Ayuntamiento de Sevilla*).

employees, 17,15% of the Seville's total registered population in 2010, 704.192<sup>4</sup>. The industrial activity has revived some sub-sectors linked to new technologies or to agri-food transformation, however this process has coexisted with both a strong industrial retraining of public sectors - naval, automotive, chemical... - that have had some impact in different areas of Andalusia and in the disappearance of SMEs associated with these sub-sectors. On the other hand, the construction sector that in 2005 represented in some provinces the main contingent of new affiliations registered at the Social Security, has suffered a sharp downturn after the bursting of the 'housing market bubble'.

On the other hand, El Ejido is located in the Poniente district in Almeria, at the very East of Andalusia, it is a recently created town which has experienced a fast growth<sup>5</sup> in recent decades by conducting an intense economic activity based on an intensive agricultural productivism developed under plastic greenhouses. El Ejido is an agro-industrial municipality configured by an intensive agrarian capitalization process and the dependence on the neo-liberal logics of the European market, such process is held on the precarization and fierce exploitation of workforce in an ethnically segmented labour market.

Therefore, the framework for the socio-labour insertion of migrants collectives, which is the object of our study, is shaped in the case of Seville by the concentration of the service sector and in El Ejido by the fast expansion of intensive agriculture, since as stated on other occasions, the immigration in Andalusia -actually alongside the whole of the Spanish State- has been primarily determined by the labour market needs. More specifically, the most of immigrant workers -women and men- have been employed in the most precarious positions of an already precarious labour market, if not in informal economic activities<sup>6</sup>. Such precariousness and the need to resort to subsistence activities have been stressed during the last three years due to the worsening of the crisis caused by financial speculation.

Accurately in the province of Seville the foreign population add up to 77.090 people<sup>7</sup>, according to official data from 2010, a tepid 4.02% of the total population. In

---

<sup>4</sup> The 499,974 public servants working in Andalucía represent 18.8% of the total national figure of 2,659,010 employees, according to data from the *Ministerio de Política Territorial*, July 2009. Andalusia is the autonomous community with the highest number of employees in the public administration.

<sup>5</sup> El Ejido became a municipality since its segregation from Dalías in 1982, emerging from a process of urban and demographic growth caused by significant internal migration fluxes in the 70's and 80's, that were stimulated by irrigation plans and the agricultural mechanization and capitalization projected by the INC and IRYDA. Until the 90s its inhabitants perceived El Ejido as 'a body without a head', framed by the free construction and private enterprises.

<sup>6</sup> A public communication by the trade union UGT from Seville, released in April 2005, stated: 'precariousness is one of the hallmarks of Seville labour market.' Similarly, a study by the Department of Social Work of the University of Seville revealed that 92.97% of contracts made to young people under 30 years in 2006 were temporary contracts, 70% of them for less than a months period ('Youth employment in the city of Seville.' Conducted by Dr. Antonio Ojeda).

<sup>7</sup> Source: *Instituto de Estadística de Andalucía*.

relation to their country of origin, the largest group is from Romania (10.203), followed by Morocco (8.889) and Bolivia (5.911). Other quantitatively significant groups are from other Latin American countries (Colombia, Ecuador and Peru), from China or from sub-Saharan countries such as Nigeria or Senegal.

Most of these foreigners are included in working age groups, especially between 16 and 40 years, in opposition to an autochthonous population pyramid with significant signs of ageing. Among the immigrant population there is also a significant majority of women, particularly in the capital and its metropolitan area.

Data from the affiliations to Social Security during 2010 in Seville province locate most of the recruitments of foreigners within the Social Security General Regime, followed by the Special Agricultural Regime and, at a distance by the Special Regime for Self-Employed Workers. Among women, there are a large percentage of contracts attached to the Special Regime for Domestic Employees. However, these formalised contracts -30.490 in 2010- do not reach half of the foreigners registered, pointing at the importance of informal economic activities. The main activities of occupation, especially among men, have been temporary agricultural labour, peonage in construction and other unskilled jobs, or the establishment of small ethnic businesses. In the case of women, domestic service and care for dependents are among their main employments, especially in the metropolitan area, as well as agricultural and other non-regularised subordinated jobs or activities including prostitution.

The analysis of the evolution of data on foreign resident population and its contrast with data on their Social Security affiliations between 2008 and 2011, leads to a significant conclusion, while the presence of foreigners has progressively increased, their affiliations to Social Security have been gradually decreasing in relation to the entire Spanish workforce. Thus, between 2008 and 2010, the employment rate among immigrant groups has dropped by almost seven points<sup>8</sup>. The immigrant foreign employees -men and women- were employed within some labour market gaps or in other activities undesired by the autochthonous workers, and they did it through a precarious or informal insertion, such a situation was more extreme among certain ethnic groups (Maghribians and sub-Saharan Africans) and among women. Nevertheless, during the last three years they have become part of the first collectives falling in situation of unemployment. Even worst, in most of the cases their unemployment benefits had been or are being depleted, while in regards to informal labour cases such benefits have never existed. Thus the deepening of the crisis is acting as a pressure factor towards a higher job insecurity and social exclusion.

---

<sup>8</sup> The series is as follows: 2008 (53,55%), 2009 (49,30%), 2010 (46,73%). Source: *Instituto de Estadística de Andalucía*.

The municipality of El Ejido is located in a vast territory characterised by a 'sea of plastic', thousands of acres covered by white plastic greenhouses. It has several population centres and scattered settlements, and it has nearly doubled its population in fifteen years from 47.610 inhabitants in 1996 to 85.389 in 2010. Foreign immigrant population add up to 34.23% of the municipal census<sup>9</sup>. This population come from 93 different countries, and it is comprise primarily by men, especially among the non-EU immigrants and particularly in the settlements that are far from the urban core, those closest to the greenhouses and which are more insanitary, where immigrant men come to constitute almost 75% of the total of foreigners registered in the census.

The total figure of foreign population registered in El Ejido is 28.444. Among them it is particularly significant, in percentage, the presence of immigrants from Morocco (17,96%). Nationals from other African countries represent over 20% and among immigrants from Eastern Europe the groups from Romania (5.37%) and Bulgaria (1.72%) have the higher representation. Only 2% are from Latin American countries. The foreign population registered in El Ejido represents 17.36% of the total working-age people in the whole province of Almeria.

General data from Social Security affiliations in Almeria province have experienced a setback between 2008 and 2011, these decrease affects all its affiliation regimes with the exception of the Special Agricultural Regime, a sector that concentrates the bulk of the activity of foreign migrant workers. In fact, the general decline in affiliations is similar in the cases of the affiliations of foreign workers, with a very sharp decline in all regimes except for the Agricultural Regime<sup>10</sup>. Particularly in el Ejido the Special Agricultural Regime is the only one remaining steady or even increasing its affiliations to the Social Security from 8.548 in 2008 to 9.211 in 2011.

Unlike the situation in relation to the Seville case and to the prospect for most of the sectors of Almeria province, agricultural employment in El Ejido and along the Poniente District of Almeria is steady and even increases. The massive introduction of foreign workforce took place as a replacement for the original immigration of autochthonous 'settlers' in the early 80's. Those original 'settlers' became owners of small and medium size family farms, located in an agro-industrial district mediated by insecure and unstable employment relationships, where the temporary use of external

---

<sup>9</sup> For the last three years the number of registered foreigners has continued significantly increasing, although with a tendency to be restrained according to the series: 2008 (27.066), 2009 (29.746), 2010 (30 571). Source: *Instituto Nacional de Estadística*.

<sup>10</sup> Between 2008 and 2011, the total number of Social Security affiliations of foreign workers in the province of Almeria fell from 49,268 to 47,436. But in the Special Agricultural Regime took place an increase in the affiliations during the same period of time, from 21,385 to 26,877. This increase regards to both men and women, although more strongly among the first. Source: *Ministerio de Trabajo e Inmigración y Secretaría de la Seguridad Social*.

work force is essential<sup>11</sup>. As a result of this, there is a very active employment offer, but an unregulated and changeable offer (changes regarding the type of production, farms or employers) for short periods of working time follow by unemployment periods that are marked by biological cycles and market fluctuations. These circumstances contribute to create a large 'reserve' of immigrant workforce waiting to access a hard work activity, with low wages, often without a contractual relationship and outside the framework of any collective agreement, such work activities are rejected by many autochthonous workers even in periods of high unemployment.

In recent years, although the crisis has not affected the agricultural activities and jobs in the same way that has had on other sectors, it has increased the insecurity and deregulation of the labour relations which contributes to increase an already extensive pocket of social exclusion, especially among immigrant groups from non-EU countries and among the latest groups of immigrants arriving.

## **2. Integration policies in the Andalusian labour market: contradictions between theory and practice**

The II Comprehensive Plan for Immigration in Andalusia 2006-2009 (hereinafter PIPIA) guides the policy for the integration of immigrants into the Andalusian labour market. This political framework, which is considered and so called 'comprehensive', covers and seeks to articulate the different fields of competence on migration of the Andalusian Ministries (*Consejerías*). In this sense, the II PIPIA (2006-2009)<sup>12</sup> has established the guidelines for the management of the socio-labour integration of immigrants followed by the Andalusian Ministry of Employment (*Consejería de Empleo de la Junta de Andalucía*). This Ministry manages through the Andalusian Employment Service SAE (*Servicio Andaluz de Empleo*) the unemployment benefits, part of the compensations in cases of collective redundancy files and both the public and private job vacancies that are submitted to them (around 7% of all the job vacancies generated in Andalusia).

The II PIPIA establishes the policy guidelines for the socio-labour integration of non-EU nationals. Such guidelines are focused, among other aspects, in information measures, vocational training linked to the needs of the labour market sectors related

---

<sup>11</sup> The foreign workforce temporarily working in the crops is a permanent reserve available for subsequent collection that greenhouses may need between October and May-June. Between July and September preparatory works are carried out in the greenhouse for the next season. This activity has also produced a specialization among the foreigners rooted in the locality.

<sup>12</sup> This plan is still the prevailing framework, since the III PIPIA, that was due to be published and to take effect in 2010, is not yet in force.



to the immigrants integration, training to promote self-employment, awareness, work regularizations related with vacancies in employments which are difficult to cover and, especially, in the development of measures for the 'recruitment in origin'<sup>13</sup> of workforce to be employed in the agricultural labour-market. In order to figure out the point of view guiding the socio-labour integration of immigrants we must pay attention to the preamble to section 2, Chapter VII of the II PIPIA, which addresses the areas of intervention and their goals. In the preamble to the 'socio-labour intervention area' the Plan asserts:

The most outstanding negative effects produced by situations of inequality or discrimination towards immigrants in relation with the labour market result in the difficulty of searching and finding their first employment, of being aware of the labour market opportunities, knowing their own professional potential, escaping from work situations characterised by poor qualifications or the lack of any qualification, (...). In order to address these negative effects it is necessary to develop training and guidance actions in agriculture, tourism, construction and domestic service, since these sectors have a higher potential of employability for the immigrant population.<sup>14</sup>

We find objectives that are coherent with these principles and which are specifically designed for the immigrants. The objective 2.2, Chapter VII of the PIPIA aims at training for the fishing and agriculture sectors, while the objective 2.5 sets measures for 'labour intermediation of non-communitarian foreign persons in the workers quota to be employed in the domestic service'. On the other hand, the Plan considers that the immigrant population must be included within the objectives designed for the general Andalusian population as whole in relation to the FPO formative measures (Vocational Occupational Training), where training workshops on hospitality, construction and care for dependents (geriatrics, home care service<sup>15</sup>, gerontology, etc.) are conducted in a way that reproduces and marks the sexual division of traditional works. This tendency of the Plan to insert, among its intervention strategies for immigration, objectives that aim at the general population as a whole falls within the discursive logics of the integration policies towards the 'normalization' of immigrant population.

Within the designed policy there are two significant elements to/from which the intervention with 'vulnerable' collectives is conducted, the first is a technical-conceptual element and the second is an organic element. These are key elements to understand the dynamics of the management that during the last decade have tended to define

---

<sup>13</sup> Objective 2.3 Chapter VII from the II PIPIA.

<sup>14</sup> II PIPIA, page 137.

<sup>15</sup> Home Care Service is a program that aims to improve the quality of life and to promote the autonomy of people in order to enable them to stay in their usual environment. Through this program it is possible to have access to social resources and domestic care support. This is a public service and is managed directly by the Andalusian local governments, or indirectly by accredited private entities whose guidance and evaluation depends on local authorities. It is regulated by both the *Orden* of November 15, 2007 from the Andalusian Ministry of Equality and Social Welfare that unifies home care as a basic provision of Community Social Services, and by the legislation emerging from the *Ley de Promoción de la Autonomía Personal y Atención de las personas en situación de dependencia*.

and interlink the areas of intervention/productive sectors/immigrants<sup>16</sup>. The first is a technical-conceptual element that consists in the definition of what the II PIPIA has called 'Zones of Social Transformation of Andalusia', and the second is an organic element consisting of the establishment and funding of the Committee on Migration (*Comisión de Migraciones*), which is a 'collegial tripartite body'<sup>17</sup> inserted within the Andalusian Council for Labour Relations, CARL (*Consejo Andaluz de Relaciones Laborales*).

The CARL is composed of organizations of employers -the Andalusian Employers Confederation, CEA (*Confederación de Empresarios de Andalucía*)- and trade unions - Andalusian General Union of Workers, UGT (*Unión General de Trabajadores de Andalucía*) and the Andalusian Workers Commission, CC.OO. (*Comisiones Obreras de Andalucía*)- both considered the 'most representative -trade unions- of our autonomous community'<sup>18</sup>. This Council has direct communication with the Andalusian Ministry of Employment (*Consejería de Empleo*). The 2.13 objective of the II PIPIA specifically aims at strengthening the Committee on Migration of the CARL supporting its migration management in Andalusia by fostering and promoting its activities: research and analysis of the labour market and immigration, training and dissemination activities on labour market and immigration. The Committee on Migration of the CARL has also among its objectives to participate in the assessment and in the proposal of quotas regarding recruitment in origin and to participate in the social concertation agreements with agricultural organizations about the salary tables for the different employment sectors.

Different targets aiming for labour orientation are planned to be implemented in the Zones of Social Transformation of Andalusia such as training in 'social skills' to facilitate the inclusion in the labour market, actions focused on 'street work to facilitate the access to' insertion and labour orientation services. The Zones of Social Transformation (also called Zones with Needs of Social Transformation-ZNTS) were defined on the bases of some studies carried out by the Institute for Advanced Studies in Andalusia, IESA (*Instituto de Estudios Avanzados de Andalucía*). This Institute reports to the Superior Council for Scientific Research, CSIC (*Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas*) and to the *Junta de Andalucía* on poverty and social exclusion in Andalusia, in order to identify socio-economic issues and to design political

---

<sup>16</sup> Obviously we do not deny that since the 80's a migratory tendency has taken place towards certain highly specialized productive regions, where the intensity of the dynamics of capitalization and the lack of autochthonous workforce has led to significant and traditional concentration of immigrants. However, adoption of policy measures, in these regions over the past decade, aiming at a particular type of migration management has produced an accumulation of effects that are evident.

<sup>17</sup> II PIPIA, page 161.

<sup>18</sup> Literal quotation on page 161 of II PIPIA.

strategies for the so-called 'Second Modernisation of Andalusia'. We must clarify that we have not found any source describing or drawing the territorial map of ZNTS so far. In fact, according to the redefinition made by the IESA, ZNTS are located in certain areas of most of the towns/cities of Andalusia, since IESA uses the indicators of poverty of the Population and Housing Census 2001 and of the Survey on Life Conditions 2004<sup>19</sup>. Therefore, few localities in Andalusia can be considered free of these exclusion zones.

Regarding the interventions in ZNTS, the actions of the Slums Programme- *Programa de Barriadas*- of the Andalusian Ministry of Social Affairs and Welfare must not be confused with the Pilot Plan 'Plural-Neighbourhoods'- '*Barrios Plurales*'- that is funded by the European Integration Fund, the Spanish Ministry of Labour and Integration, and the Andalusian Ministry of Employment, and has been implemented since 2010 in the districts of La Macarena (Seville), El Puche (Almeria) and in the *200 viviendas* slum in Roquetas de Mar (Almeria)<sup>20</sup> by the General Directorate for Migration Policies (DGPM). This pilot Plan aims to intervene in neighbourhoods with a high concentration of immigrants in order to improve the neighbours coexistence and its management has been awarded respectively to the organizations ACCEM<sup>21</sup> and CEPAIM. The Slums Programme of the Andalusian Ministry of Social Affairs provides actions towards employment and it has been managed under the logic of 'normalization', therefore, except for the labour guidance programme managed by the pro-immigrant and supra-provincial network 'Andalusia Welcomes' - '*Andalucía Acoge*'-, the specialised organizations on intervention with immigrants have not been taken into

---

<sup>19</sup> According to the demarcation made by the IESA these are areas with more than 25 excluded households in a section with more than 15% of excluded households, or areas with more than 50 households with at least one section with more than 10% of excluded households. In the case of scattered settlements they are taken into account if they have more than 25 excluded households with more than 15% of households excluded, or if they have more than 50 excluded households with more than 10% of excluded households. Hence, the Andalusian EQUAL Programs and the Actions in Slums and Zones with Needs of Social Transformation managed by the Andalusian Ministry of Equality and Social Welfare - *Consejería de Igualdad y Bienestar Social*- (2004-2005), have been executed taking into account municipalities with a medium-high average standard of living in the province of Seville such as *Alcalá de Guadaíra*, *Dos hermanas* and Seville, but with areas of social exclusion in certain neighbourhoods, or in the very city of Almeria. Women, gypsies and immigrants are the targeted collectives of these programs for orientation, training and information on access to employment. In the case of Almeria have been considered the neighbourhoods *La Chanca* and *El Puche*, in Seville the neighbourhoods *Polígono Norte*, *Polígono Sur*, *Torreblanca* and *Amate*.

<sup>20</sup> We only quote the interventions related to our study, as they are also conducted in districts of Granada and Algeciras. We consider interesting to note that the *200 viviendas* slum in Roquetas de Mar is a public housing neighbourhood where in September 2008 there was an ethnic conflict between Spanish, Senegalese and Moroccans. As a result of this conflict a Senegalese man was killed. The conflict led to rioting with destruction of urban furniture and private properties. The *Programa de Barriadas* in the city of Almeria and Roquetas de Mar is exclusively managed by CEPAIM that conducts it through its partner *Almería Acoge*. Before the designation of the areas of intervention in 2009 an application of the Ombudsman of Andalusia and the *Diputación de Almería* to catalogue the scattered settlement of Las Norias de Daza in El Ejido as a ZNTS was rejected, though it is a locality affected by a significant scattered substandard housing.

<sup>21</sup> To implement it out this agency has developed agreements with FSA, CODENAF and Anima Vitae.

account, neither the associations composed of immigrant groups. In the available reports published about the programmes implemented in some of these ZNTS during 2004 and 2005 there are no organizations of immigrants neither pro-immigrant organizations accessing to grants specifically designed to fund private entities<sup>22</sup>. However the Slums Programme carries out an intervention that may be considered incoherent with the principle (though such principle may be arguable) of 'normalization' of minorities as it earmarks some grants to projects of different gypsies organizations from Granada and Seville. Another issue to be assessed is how resources are distributed. As shown in the reports, the funding of social organizations of minorities is usually insignificant in comparison with the funds awarded for projects of supra-provincial organizations which are professionalised in social intervention, probably with many more human resources and infrastructures as the result of years of privileged access to public funding, but often with a relative social impact due to their disconnection from the social fabric of the neighbourhoods. At this stage, it is possible to make some assessments on the effects and causes of this subsidy policy, though we will postpone it until the section 5 of this paper.

Both the role of the Committee on Migration of the CARL and the social interventions in ZNTS have a more or less direct effect on the immigrant population settled in Andalusia, and specifically with regard to the localities addressed by our research. As can be seen from the above mention, the ZNTS enable to act in local marginalised social environments, while the role of the Committee on Migration has a more direct impact in the assessment of the evolution and dynamics of the labour market, the immigrant collectives and the social relations in work environments. There is a clear disconnection between these two instruments of intervention, moreover, actions in ZNTS aiming at the spheres of health, employment, education and local coexistence fit into the direct management of regional and local public administrations by the attendance of local governments to public grants that afterwards they derived to private organizations through the same system. On the other hand, the CARL guides the political interventions with a high impact on the labour market in which immigrant work force is inserted, with a clear disconnection in respect to the social interests of the ZNTS and the prevalence of the interests held by the employers, in fact these interests are framing the CARL and its Committee on Migration, which is specifically funded by the II Comprehensive Plan of Junta de Andalucía<sup>23</sup>. Through its parallelism with the

---

<sup>22</sup> The Slums Programme managed by the Ministry of Social Affairs and Welfare conducted actions for a total of 3.169.307,90 € in Seville, and 976.663,72 € in Almería.

<sup>23</sup> This body is the equivalent to the Andalusian Tripartite Labour Commission of Immigration at the state level. It has a key role in the establishment of quotas of recruitment in origin and 'to satisfy the employment

state-endorsed Tripartite Labour Commission it is possible to confirm once again how discourses, structures of participation and the management of resources in Andalusia does not deviate an iota from the State policy on migration. Therefore, if the migration policy of the Spanish state has been called a 'non-model' of integration by various authors<sup>24</sup>, we might well wonder whether the Andalusian policy, with its comprehensive plans, should not be seen from the same perspective.

Thus, only considering this disjunction it is possible to figure out the permanent reality of immigrants overcrowding in scattered settlements for decades in the agricultural territory of the Poniente of Almeria and specifically in El Ejido, our locality of research. This is an environment of invisibilised marginalization and misery, because it does not fit within the ZNTS which were designed according to the Housing Census of 2001, since there is neither census nor recognised housing outside the districts and the urban areas. However, at the same time this marginalised environment is an effect of the productive specialization from which this economy depends.

In the case of Seville there is a labour market dominated by informal economy in the hospitality, construction and services sectors, where a female immigration, inserted mostly in domestic service and care for dependent population, is the mainstay of the family's economy in the midst of the crisis juncture. This is a highly unregulated, precarious and ethnicised employment sector at the mercy of an invisibilization caused by the inviolable and private domain of the 'domestic' sphere. On the other hand, the residential concentration in the urban districts of Macarena, Macarena Norte, Cerro-Amate and Sur, which have the greatest concentration of population and major structural deficiencies, has an increasing appearance of multiculturalism, where the resident population is reconstructing itself and reinterpreting the social spaces on the bases of the new requirements and existing demands. Among these urban spaces those built in the Macarena neighbourhood are the ones constructed and perceived by the social agents and the regional administration as sensitive areas at risk of coexistence, because of the emerging and increasing multiculturalization of this neighbourhood. These enclaves are the destination of most of the programs for awareness and coexistence in multicultural environments supported by the European Social and Cohesion Funds and by the state and regional administrations. In parallel to this, there is a significant gap in the development of infrastructural improvement projects and socio-spatial articulation projects conducted by the local government, which is the political and administrative level that should be responsible of the citizen's

---

needs for those jobs not covered by resident workers', as can be read in the *Orden* TAS/1713/2005 of June 3.

<sup>24</sup> González de Durana, A. (coord.), 2007: 27.

social integration.

The most of the demographic contingent of non-EU citizens are in the most precarious sectors of the different local labour markets and in the most deficient urban environments of the localities addressed in our research. In Seville, we find a major labour inclusion of women in invisibilised and unregulated sectors, while in El Ejido there is a highly unregulated agricultural labour market which is directly affected by the decisions on recruitments in origin and salary tables established within the social concertation agreements set in the CARL. Thus, job insecurity, structural lack of affordable housing and social environments with high concentrations of marginalised population are linked, resulting in a glaring deficit of integration which makes of poverty and racial discrimination a structural phenomenon.

Moreover, the fact that intervention programs can only be locally accomplished through the voluntary annexation to the awarding procedure or through the application of local governments, unions and bodies of the third sector to grant calls made by the *Junta de Andalucía*, implies that the lack of interest of local governments to develop certain projects in their municipalities, or vested interests among certain social sectors and party-political purposes, suspend the effects of projects aiming at ZNTS, as indeed happens in El Ejido and in the precarious immigration policy of the Seville City Council. This lack of appropriate local policies for the social integration of the most vulnerable collectives of population who live in fragile urban environments, in regards with infrastructural deficits affecting such groups, and especially in relation with the lack of interest of the local governments to voluntarily apply to programs with specific resources, as shown in the reports of the grant-calls referred, could be interpreted as manifestations of 'environmental racism' in the sense defined by Benjamin Chavis in relation with certain localities of the USA<sup>25</sup>. However, these processes are interpreted in some official documents published in certain Spanish urban environments under the semantics of the politically correct euphemism: the Housing Monograph Draft 2010 presented by the Commission for Integration Policy, Participation and Interculturalism<sup>26</sup>, names the process as 'residential discrimination'.

Thus, an unreceptive opinion towards social integration policies is transfer to the

---

<sup>25</sup> Benjamin Chavis (1987) pinpoints the existence of an 'environmental racism' in the decisions adopted when designing urban development planning in certain urban areas and conurbations of EE. UU. One of Chavis' evidences is the location of sites where construction activities generating waste, odors, hazards that are difficult to be pinned down, unsanitary conditions and a worsening of the quality of life of its occupants.

<sup>26</sup> The Commission on Integration Policy, Participation and Interculturality inserted in the Forum for Social Integration of Immigrants, sponsored by the Spanish Ministry of Labour and Immigration, assumes the responsibilities of Welcoming, Social Services, Health, Housing and Participation. Its components are the CEPAIM Foundation (the board), *Junta de Andalucía* (represented by the General Directorate of Migration Policy and its Head of Coordination and Institutional Relations), Murcia region, ACHE, AESC FENADEE and Red Cross.

discourse of the social mediation agents. It is widespread an unfavourable assessment of the effects emerging from the social integration policy of the *Junta de Andalucía*. This assessment has its roots in the organizations' work on the ground and their experiences with the perverse effects of the mechanisms for the direct management of the resources available for intervention. That is, in the 'somersault' that occurs between political discourse and practice, between theory and praxis. Intermediation agents from specialised organizations and immigrants' organizations share the same opinion, from their point of view, in certain marginalised environments with high concentrations of immigrants the situation of social breakdown has not improved but rather has become chronic. This would not consist in the design and construction of mechanisms for political action that actually exist, but in the use made of such mechanisms in order to promote desirable social integration effects.

Thus, we found in our fieldwork a prevailing perception among organizations and institutions, which coincide in their critical assessment of the social impact of the Comprehensive Plan of the Junta, and on the idea that policies and resources have been wasted in practices of low positive impact.

[The Plans are] a make-over. The Aliens Act is so fierce, so discriminatory, that hinders the access to the channels to formally achieve the residence and work permits, and the citizenship or quasi- citizenship -as having formal papers does not imply having full citizenship-. The Aliens policy, the Aliens Act is so fierce that the Plans are not enough to achieve equal rights. [In relation to the measures to tackle the effects of unemployment among immigrants] There are no local policies for these issues, or at least I am not aware of them. (Informant: Pro-immigrant association's president)

Therefore, it is common among NGOs, trade unions and local public servants the idea that one thing is 'what the Plans assert' and other very different things are their effects: social agents distinguish perfectly between the Plans as a political text and the intervention policy mechanisms. It is an extended, politically correct discourse the one stating that 'the Comprehensive Plans of the Junta are pioneer policies and the most advanced in Spain' from the textual standpoint, this is a recurrent comment among the main trade unions, some agents from supra-provincial organizations of the third sector and the agents of the regional administration itself. However, there is a widespread opinion among the intermediation agents of the minority trade unions, immigrant associations, NGOs and other local organizations and local administrations, which believe that the 'policy is fine but there is still much to do, since there are not enough resources'; that 'the paper is accommodating but another thing are the social effects'; that 'the Junta spends a lot of resources in brochures and manuals' instead of increasing technical resources and services; that the policy is 'very intercultural'

through the written discourse but not that much in the practice<sup>27</sup>. Specifically, with respect to the labour market insertion, it is also widespread that some filters are set to access to employment when job vacancies are offered through profiles that leave out the characteristics of immigrant communities, thus these covered discriminatory filters take place in the administrative practice that prevents the access to recruitment competitions on equal bases.

In the texts of these mentioned plans [PIPIA, PECE], expressions such as multiculturalism, intercultural relation, respect for the identity of immigrant collectives appear several times, they are often repeated. And another thing is whether this is viable in the practice. Because one thing is the wording of major theoretical principles, nowadays it is unthinkable not to include them, but another thing is that at the time when conditions are required to apply for certain grants of specific programs, it is then when you will actually note whether there is such multiculturalism, identity and so on. Because when certain requirements are demanded to the people in order to intervene, it is then when a filter is used or the other. And of course, for the most significant interventions, the deepest ones and the ones operating for a longer term are focused in rooted people, in immigrants who are more or less rooted and with documentation, with a work, job seekers registered within the SAE, etc. So we must distinguish these two dimensions: the level of principles and theoretical statements, which is an indisputable fact, and another level... after ... when it comes to put these principles into a specific practice, it is when certain requirements arise that will severely constrain these declarations of intent. (Informant: NGO management)

...because everything holds up on paper, but real changes are not observed, therefore we are very critical in these policies. The important thing would be to see if they are effective, this would require an assessment and to verify what outcomes produce in practice, instead of spending so much money on advertising and brochures, other resources would be needed to ensure that measures are real, effective and durable. [...] Good practice should be addressed to ensure that contracts in origin do not serve as a laboratory to see which groups or nationalities work better and cheaper. (Informant: trade union's technician)

Taking into consideration the career promotion for immigrants, there seems to be no interest in making use of highly qualify or highly specialised human resources. Rather the contrary, it seems an irrelevant consideration, or at least, it is consider as a possible matter for social confrontation because of the labour competition which could cause with autochthonous workers and professionals. Along the last decade became clear that immigrants with high training and qualify profiles had an insurmountable obstacle in the administrative constrains for the recognition of their academic qualifications. This later problem has been evident with the inclusion of highly qualified scholarships from the Maghreb in certain departments of the University of Seville. The structural location of the immigrants in the most precarious employments of the most deregulated economic sectors (Agriculture, Tourism and Hospitality, Construction and Domestic Service and/or Care for Dependents) carried out by the state endorsed institutions, prevents also to make use of this highly qualified contingent, who moves to other countries after staying in Spain to obtain regularised documentation. Only jobs and occupations that are difficult to covered allow to a specifically qualified minority of

---

<sup>27</sup> We have decided to protect the entities' identity in the quotations here reproduced, since they are at a disadvantaged when accessing to public funding resources in respect to the major organizations.



workers to escape from this dominant tendency, these workers usually come from traditional and craft jobs which are falling into disuse or definitely regressing<sup>28</sup>.

### **3. The situation of non-EU national workers to access their labour rights and the role of intermediary agents in this process**

The social position of migrants in respect with their access to citizenship rights such as the right to vote in local elections<sup>29</sup> and to the rights of workers, is subject primarily to their status as non-EU foreigners living in Spain with residence and work permit documents, or without them. The fact of been 'documented'<sup>30</sup> (to be in possession of that documentation regulated by the Aliens Law in force) or to be 'undocumented' (to be in the lack of such documents as a consequence of being in the process of accessing to the legal requirements to do so, or because those rights have been removed in relation to the loss of such requirements) determines dramatically the access to these rights<sup>31</sup>.

The non-EU nationals with an undocumented administrative status can be considered as non-existent in respect to their daily relations with the administration and services, although it is physically obvious that they are actually among the alive and productive citizens. Undocumented foreign people can not open a bank account or rent an apartment, they can not access to the services of public programmes designed for immigrants care, they can not be recruited in the labour market, have no rights of assembly neither of free association, cannot formalise the registrations in order to study at schools or to access to adult education, can not register their home in the local

---

<sup>28</sup> German or French business organizations have contacted the services of *Andalucía Orienta* for the labour insertion of immigrants located in some NGOs, in order to recruit specialized immigrants in aerospace, industrial and nuclear engineering. These recruitments were carried out and those immigrants left their informal works in the hospitality and agriculture sectors of Seville province. People trained in traditional trade works such as carpentry, metalwork, rebar, formwork, etc. sometimes are recruit to cover vacancies difficult to cover in Seville, while in Almeria the vacancies which are difficult to be covered are those related with the fishing sector and the professional sport.

<sup>29</sup> The right to vote also depends on the existence of bilateral agreement between countries. States with reciprocal agreements in force, signed by Spain are: Norway, Ecuador, New Zealand, Colombia, Chile, Peru, Paraguay, Iceland, Bolivia, Cape Verde, these States recognize the right to vote in municipal elections to Spanish citizens residing in their territory. The legal framework of reference is based on art.6 of the *Proyecto de Ley Orgánica de reforma de la Ley Orgánica 4/2000*, from 11 January 2009, *sobre derechos y libertades de los extranjeros en España y su integración social*.

<sup>30</sup> In the politically correct language the use of these designations has been widespread, after a long social debate, which took place in organizational environments during the late 90's questioning the abuse of the concepts 'regular/irregular' and/or 'legal/illegal'. There was an agreement about the idea that, though human beings may or may not be subject to certain laws and rights, it should not be allowed to label them with colloquial terms emerging from legal jargon usually associated with things.

<sup>31</sup> Although in Spain the rights to education and health care are universal and protocols have been arranged for the access to basic care of anyone who is in the country, the full enjoyment of these services and the access to housing, freedom of association and the citizenship rights mentioned are completely restricted to non-EU foreign nationals without a residence and/or work permit.

census if they do not prove to have at least a contract, or similar, even when they are actually residing in a located and registered house<sup>32</sup>. They can only access the emergency health services, so they have no access to public social shelters and canteens, and they can be arrested just for being in an irregular situation<sup>33</sup>. Thus, the daily life of these people is seriously constrained in relation with their chances to access to resources and civil rights.

However, a contingent of undocumented non-EU immigrants is a permanent reality that along the last decade has, for some periods, add up to one million people, with some particular and circumstantial decreases like the one generated by the extraordinary regularization process carried out in 2005<sup>34</sup>. The incongruity of the Spanish immigration policy in respect to this reality is evident in the everyday experience of social organizations and administrative bodies themselves<sup>35</sup>.

Moreover, social organizations are unable to support undocumented immigrants given the political guidelines of the administrations funding their programs; on the other hand, neither within the crisis situation, nor before it, could be seriously considered implementing repatriations by expulsion orders because of the cost that repatriations imply and the lack of legislation and bilateral agreements with certain countries. The result is that a significant part of the undocumented immigrant population can at least walk around with the deportation order in their pockets as a document that, maybe someday, will serve for them to make use of the over three years well rooted figure, as a condition to apply for their regularization. During this period of time they will enlarge the irregular contingent of immigrants who live struggling from irregular works. The existence of this contingent has the obvious function of keeping production costs down and of containing low salary-tables in the agricultural sector, such salary-tables are settled annually through the social concertation agreements established by

---

<sup>32</sup> As undocumented immigrants are unable to formalize rental contracts, normally they reside in shared housing subject to the conditions of the tenant who made the formal housing contract.

<sup>33</sup> The Committee for the Eradication of Racial Discrimination of UN reported Spain for the detention of immigrants through racist profiling used by police in a hearing held on February 23, 2011 in Geneva. In early 2011 % the number of arrests of illegal immigrants had increased by 120%, the most affected collective was of Moroccan origin. Some organizations came to denounce a racial arrests policy and police raids targeting individuals with phenotypic features that allow identifying them as coming from the Maghreb.

<sup>34</sup> Before the extraordinary process of 2005 a total of 1,175,587 undocumented immigrants in working age were estimated to be in Spain based on the population census data. There were 690,679 applications for work and residence permits, of which about 600,000 were granted. In January 2010 it was estimated a total of 964,071 illegal immigrants. The unemployment rate was a 30.24% of non-EU resident population (4,744,169 people), that is, 1,105,400 immigrants were unemployed.

<sup>35</sup> This can be extended, with certain specificities, to the Mediterranean countries than within the dominant logic on immigration of the EU countries become mainly into countries containing fluxes. Some experts have called such policies 'Mediterranean model' (Finotelli, 2007) of partial or 'half' citizenship (de Lucas y de la Cueva, 2010).

organizations of employers, unions and the state administration in the frame of the CARL.

One of the most pernicious effects of the financial crisis lasting since 2008, in relation with the social integration of immigrants in Andalusia, is the increasing number of immigrants who are falling into the undocumented status after been with a regularised residence permit in the country. The provisions of the legislation on the need to be affiliated to the Social Security for a minimum of six months to ensure the renewal of the residence permit is a difficult constraint to meet given the situation of employment loss and the increase of irregular economy, highly precarious wages and irregular employment. Thus, immigrants with a long residence background, who have even accomplished the reunification of all, or part, of their nuclear family, become vulnerable to poverty and to be marginalised from the social care resources. In these situations, the administrative strengthen of control over the use and enjoyment of social benefits by the immigrants makes even more difficult to carry out domestic economic strategies that may allow the families to survive under conditions of greater dignity. The SAE is monitoring registered immigrants in order to verify if they are at their residence or outside the country as a measure to remove their social benefits, this measure far from being an effective system of controlling social fraud, is a system of pressure on residents without citizenship rights to force them to return to their countries, or at least to the return of part of their family, nevertheless this strategy also helps to decrease the pressure of dependent people on the social welfare systems. Under these circumstances, non-EU residents usually experience precarious situations and needs, even food needs, which affect the entire families. There is no evidence of any similar measures affecting to the general Spanish unemployed population who is also getting benefits. In fact, the lack of control is increasing irregular practices, people is combining social benefits with intermittent and deregulated working days (with no affiliation to the Social Security) in the construction, agriculture and hospitality sectors.

In these highly deregulated labour sectors business practices tend, in the current crisis panorama, to seek reproductive conditions and benefits by maintaining part of the workers without any labour rights, social security and working in breach of labour law. Undocumented immigrants are collectives especially susceptible to suffer the pressure of these kinds of practices and extortions in relation to the assessment of their efficiency by certain employers. In this sense, we believe that the crisis has favoured a propitious space for discriminatory and racist practices linked to the business activity. Two of these practices within the agricultural sector are very significant: the first is a 'legal' practice, legitimised by the employers organizations and trade unions agreements that has been affecting all workers subject to recruitment in origin. The

salary-tables scales are agreed upon at the end of each season between organizations of employers and trade unions. As the workers who are recruited in origin usually have already returned home, the updated wages that usually are adjusted with an increase over the previous year do not affect them, since they are not in the farms these increments are never given to them, neither is it sent to their place of origin. The second practice is related to the establishment of a new figure related to what has been called along the Andalusian countryside 'service enterprises'. Farms are visited by these companies embodied in a mediation agent with vehicle and mobile phone who negotiates beside the farm the value of the crop per kilograms, paying to the workers in relation to the amount of kilograms that they have collected, instead of paying them regulated wages (this is the system followed to establish the salary tables). Therefore the self-exploitation of the workers themselves is obvious as they try to obtain a higher fee 'piece' that will always be lower than a regulated wage salary.

In relation to the labour market in Seville, where there is a strong demand of workforce to be employed in the domestic service and care for the dependent service, one of the immediate effects of the crisis has been the decrease of wages in the sector, becoming even more precarious than before. As men lost their employments because of the recession of the service sector, the construction collapsed and the downturn in hospitality, thus immigrant women working in domestic service have become the persons sustaining their homes with a significant degradation of the quality of life of these families. Wages have fallen to 400-500 Euros per month and there is a higher incidence of informal work, thus women become the heads of household sustaining a poor basic family subsistence economy, especially when the right to unemployment benefits has expired for other family members.

Regarding this sector and the demand of immigrant women to be employed in domestic and care service, some organizations have specialised in the management of specific job banks. This is the case of a well-known religious congregation *Hermanas de María Inmaculada de Sevilla*, which manages a contingent of these workers for the supply and demand of domestic and care services in the city. This religious congregation is located in the order's headquarters in the historic centre of Seville and is a reference among both, the networks of immigrant women and certain middle and high-class groups who demand internal or external domestic workers, undocumented or not. This entity seeks to provide the best candidate based on a profile established by the employer without going into too many assessments about the working conditions to be established. The adequacy of supply and demand is achieved through 'profiles a la carte' according to the needs of the employer, who sometimes even ask for a young woman with studies and English language skills to teach the children of the family. The

entity is in charge of 'training them in domestic service or care skills and grooming them to have a proper personal appearance'<sup>36</sup> taking into account the requirements of the right candidate for her correct inclusion in the workplace. Since the domestic service takes place in the private sphere this implies, rather than in other types of work, an adaptation of women workers to the specificities of the 'know how' according to the tastes of the employer, these are implicitly subordinated labour relations covered by the invisibility of the *domus*. Many undocumented women can only access to the regularization process through the formal request of their employer after been employed as internal domestic or care service workers for several years for the very same family<sup>37</sup>. This reality makes of this sector an environment of submission for many women.

The trade unions carry out principally functions of information and labour market orientation. It is unusual for the unions to denounce employers, bosses or businessmen regarding the infringement of the workers' rights. Under their informative function the trade unions establish a relation with the offended employee in order to 'assess his/her case and to study the realistic options of success'<sup>38</sup>. In this sense, it is clear that they intervene in the process that prevents to start a prosecution, in this step the most of the immigrants who's rights have been offended desist to take legal actions. If the immigrant reports to the union about non-payment or unfair dismissal, trade unions will just mediate between the worker and the employer for them to make an agreement about the payment of the debt or of part of it.

There is a clear separation between the ways these issues are faced by 'mayor' trade unions, those considered 'representative' like CC.OO. and UGT, and the way they are faced by other trade unions that, though they might be minor unions in respect to all sectors together, they have a significant importance in specific sectors and in some agricultural regions of Andalusia, such as USO, CGT and SOC-SAT. In particular, the Agricultural Workers Union (SOC-SAT), with a strong presence and activity among agricultural migrant workers in Western Almeria, is the union entering more pleas for the breach of collective agreements, thus, SOC-SAT remains outside of the institutionalised wage negotiations, as they consider such negotiations as 'a game' to legitimise the aspirations of agricultural employers. At the same time administrations, organizations of employers and major trade unions expressly prevent any participation of this minor union in such negotiations.

---

<sup>36</sup> Inverted commas for the verbatim expressions from the interview

<sup>37</sup> The 'external' domestic service worker goes to work in the home of her employer in daily with a previously agreed roster. On the contrary, the 'internal' domestic service worker lives in the home of her employing family.

<sup>38</sup> Literal from the interview.

#### 4. The precariousness of integration in the context of economic crisis

The worsening of the job insecurity and the increase of situations of social exclusion among immigrant workers and also among the autochthonous workers, are radicalizing the competition between these two collectives of workers for the access to the trifling job opportunities. The most precarious and irregular employments, in recent years rejected by the Andalusian workers, are becoming 'attractive' for them, either by the possibility of combining un-officially these irregular (underground) jobs with unemployment benefits or other kind of benefits, or just because this sort of job is the only alternative in cases of severe need. This situation tends to become common, though still having a minor presence in the agricultural districts of intensive production.

In this context some phenomenons are emerging, although they had never completely disappeared, they just were regressing or at least restrained. We refer to the return to the widespread discriminatory situations of the 90's, so that, for example, for the citizens' perception 'Immigration' reappears as a major 'problem'. Immigrants are perceived as direct competitors, hence low and stagnant wages and the lack of jobs for autochthonous workers is perceived as the immigrants' fault. Studies conducted by OBERAXE point to the return, or even the increase, of discourses equating immigration with 'problems' related to: housing, health, public health system, benefits and/or coexistence in a significant segment of the Spanish population<sup>39</sup>. Other studies in this line show that the perception of the Andalusian population to the fact of immigration in a negative sense accounts a 45%, ousting 'public insecurity' from the first place of the problems' ranking. Other percentage rates specified that 27% of respondents consider necessary 'immigrants workforce', while 73% did not consider important their contribution. In addition, 85% of the Andalusian population think that the presence of immigrants should be necessarily linked to an employment contract as a means for administrative regularization<sup>40</sup>.

In this context, the political attempts to invisibilised migrant collectives are re-emerging; moreover, racist campaigns and discourses re-emerge from conservative sectors of the local authorities that have a growing electoral support. In the current economic situation the increase of irregularities can exceed the most critical moments

---

<sup>39</sup> This is registered in the document prepared by the Spanish Observatory of Racism and Xenophobia (OBERAXE), M<sup>a</sup> Ángeles Cea D'Ancona, Michael S. Valles Martínez (2010). '*Living Together: Ciudadanía Europea contra el Racismo y la Xenofobia*', where highlights at a qualitative level the relationship between immigration/problem as one of the representations grouped after the fieldwork, especially in relation to the workplace.

<sup>40</sup> Rinken, S., Escobar, M<sup>a</sup>. Velasco, S. (2010). *Opiniones y actitudes de la población andaluza ante la inmigración (III): Más allá del discurso funcionalista*. General Directorate for the Coordination of Migratory Policies, Andalusian Ministry of Labour. *Junta de Andalucía*.

of the 90's, since within the political invisibilizing trend any reference to a regulatory process cannot even be suggested. Thus, it finally increases the stock of undocumented people, now composed of new arrived migrants and those ones with a longer immigrant background who failed into an irregular situation because of the chronic unemployment.

Moreover, the loss of the family home, sometimes as a result of the execution embargoes as a consequence of the non-payment of mortgage loans must be added to the precariousness and social marginality that take place when immigrants with a long resident background suffer chronic unemployment, falling into situations of legal irregularity. It is noticeable an increasing return of families, that once could benefit from family reunification procedures, to their countries of origin with the effect of dislocation and disintegration for the whole family. These dynamics are occurring especially among Maghribians and Ecuadorian collectives. There are Ecuadorian families that give up completing their process of family reunification; they even take the option of returning the school-age children, leaving their care to relatives in their place of origin. Thus they eliminate part of the family burden when they are in the need to return to work practices and intensive roster outside their home, such as those experienced in the early years of their migratory path.

The provisional return to their place of origin is a kind of domestic economic strategy for the subsistence of many Moroccan immigrants in Andalusia, who will wait for the economic conditions to improve in Spain. We understand this as an emergency or recovery of traditional domestic economic strategies taking place between border areas, which are recovered through the adaptation of practices of economic fluxes and traditional exchanges between these neighbouring territories<sup>41</sup>. However these Moroccan immigrants are currently constrained because of the role played by the control of cross-border fluxes in this process, thus they are constrained by the risks of losing their documentation if they are not affiliated to the Social Security for the minimum period legally required and by the SAE' control of the residence of the unemployed immigrants who are receiving unemployment benefits. This control is seriously jeopardizing the development of transnational economic strategies to alleviate the plight of many family economies. Regarding the context of domestic economic strategies in border environments, the dilemma in which Moroccan immigrants are contrasts, paradoxically, with the increased of migratory movements of Andalusian

---

<sup>41</sup> The seasonal migration fluxes, named by the classic academic production on migration in the Mediterranean as 'swallow' migration, in the case of women consist in domestic service and seasonal hospitality jobs, and in the case of men in seasonal agricultural works, these were traditional practices between northern Morocco and Andalusia in the 80's. This was registered by an ethnography conducted in Seville and El Ejido by Castaño (2003 and 2005).

workers who carry out a 'two-way' or 'swallow' migration process for weekly or temporary periods, in order to be employed in the construction labour market created by the housing boom in northern Morocco. It is progressively extended to resource to construction works in Spanish companies that have resorted to this kind of relocation, this situation is allowing to many Andalusian workers to combine irregular works in Morocco with the perception of the Spanish unemployment benefits.

The current situation marks an obvious difference between autochthonous and immigrants, the difference between a pretended policy for the immigrants' integration and a migration model of partial citizenship that has characterised the Mediterranean migration model, in which we must locate and analyse the Spanish immigration policy. The crisis highlights the lack of the immigrants' integration in Spain, in our case in Andalusia. As stated above, both the difficulty of equal access to a limited labour market and the labour integration policy practiced are producing outcomes such as the over-exploitation of immigrant women, who are also expose to salary reductions while supporting their families by working in domestic service, care, hospitality, and in the worst cases, in prostitution. Other outcomes emerging from the current situation and political practices are the over-exploitation and the increase of job insecurity among men in the territories specialised in agriculture, and a shocking increase of labour insertion in the illicit economy as many of these collectives need to subsist beyond the unemployment benefit.

In this context, it is clear that the emergence of transnational domestic economic practices, as stated above, the 'new' transnational dynamics of subsistence in the most vulnerable sectors, must be considered not simply as an example of the ability of the most disadvantaged collectives to adapt themselves to the hard context of the crisis, as could be thought by the most optimistic, but as an evidence questioning the model of integration. The social practices of economic complementarity between the neighbouring territories of Andalusia and Morocco is an unquestionable reality observable through the vicissitudes of the 20th Century in both countries, this fact does nothing but to increase the paradox of the discourse on cultural un-integrability. The new social practices deployed to subsist with one foot on either side of the Strait of Gibraltar by collectives of immigrants and vulnerable collectives of Andalusian workers clarifies the reality of a highly 'flexible' market. Such market rather than creating employment, generates higher benefits through the use made of low wages costs, job insecurity, exploitation of workers, residential instability or multi-located residence adapted to the needs of the labour market, and a sort of transnational subsistence strategies to get around the traditional and increasingly archaic territorial sovereignty carried out by people who attempt to reproduce their living conditions by 'integrating'



*transnationally* themselves. That is, they are transformed into partial citizens in more than one society affected by both different supranational realities and supranational contexts.

## **5. A reflection on the institutional racism in Andalusia**

The way in which the economic crisis affects the most vulnerable social groups, either autochthonous or immigrants, and the social effects arising from such crisis urge us to do a necessary and in-depth reflection on the institutional ability against discrimination, racism and xenophobia in a dependent and economically peripheralised territory such as Andalusia. Ultimately, it is necessary to carry out a reflection on the impenetrability of racism in the institutions, i.e. on the ability to prevent institutional racism. From the point of view of integration, we cannot ignore the social effects of certain practice legitimised by custom and by traditional interests of socio-political networks established during decades of migratory experience in Spain. No one can think of perpetuating any intervention policies without an effective assessment of the social impact of those policies developed under the framework of 'normalization' and funded by the state and the European Union; neither without reflecting on and assessing the impact of the advisory bodies and the implemented mechanisms for diagnosing, regulating and intervening; Without evaluating the effectiveness of this advice for intervention developed by specialised forums and specialised commissions with a highly mediatised participation of the representation of minorities-political object; Without questioning the praxis perpetuated by networks of collective interests that have 'naturally' tended and tend to reproduce the conditions of a dominant status quo. These are all consequences of the glaring lack of integration after two decades of central/state Aliens Policy and a decade of a specifically designed regional policy, as we have been showing. All these reasons lead to the implementation of a Spanish and Andalusian model that is embedded within the so-called 'Mediterranean migratory model'<sup>42</sup>, which has as its main axes the control of fluxes and the establishment of the conditions for a partial citizenship.

As part of these reflections, we outline some of the aspects to be taken into account when considering the possible institutional racism. While the development and implementation of a regional immigration policy which did not exist before is a positive note (as explained in the document wp1.02, the socio-political context in certain localities of Andalusia has a decisive influence on this policy), it is also a reality that

---

<sup>42</sup> Finotelli, Op.cit.

especially in those details related with the mechanisms of participation and intervention turns out to be not that original. In fact in regard to labour, educational and medical care insertion (the key areas of integration) this policy has developed working committees and participatory forums which have been unaware of the dynamics and structures already established along the second half of the 90's at a state level. This is the case of the Committee of Immigration of the CARL, which we have already explained, or the Andalusian Immigration Forum (*Foro Andaluz de la Inmigración*), to name just two examples of advisory bodies with a certain capacity to influence on political intervention. The radical emphasis on the discourse of 'normalization', that from our point of view has been an institutional response leading to the political flight from the discourses and policies of positive multiculturalist discrimination, that have fallen out of favour in the European context, seriously hampers the implementation of any specific programs for immigrant population, though such specific programs are absolutely necessary in order to address the total lack of human rights among immigrant collectives in certain localities of Andalusia, specifically in those where their productive basic sector needs low labour costs and a workforce subjected to a situation disabling them to defend their rights in an organised way<sup>43</sup>.

This ideological and discursive position developed by the Andalusian policy in the different areas of intervention, does not permit to make visible the abusive exercise of power of the agents who are interacting in daily bases in the services, where/when there are such services. In the specific case of the labour market insertion we have already noted above the institutional practices constraining the access to labour market on equal basis. Therefore, it is evident that inequality is structural when the immigrant's background does not match with the demands that are institutionally established. One example is the above-mentioned ineffectiveness in the recognition of the immigrants' academic qualifications.

In this context, it is surprising, to say the least, how the 'normalizer' discourse for foreign minorities becomes into a discourse of positive discrimination for autochthonous minorities. The above mentioned action policies in ZNTS with gypsy minorities are a good example of this question. The double standards that consider

---

<sup>43</sup> One of the most negative aspects of how the administration understands the 'normalization' by its invisibilizing effects that hinder the understanding of reality and the access to objective data for the assessment of the policies implemented, consist in not to register, as statistical value, the data about the origin of migrants. Such data are potential indicators of the presence of cultural diversity in social areas suitable for intervention. These aspects have been confirmed in the interviews conducted and in the Department of Equality and Social Welfare of the *Junta de Andalucía*, and also in our research experience. During the years of implementation of the I and II PIIA (since 2002) there has not been registration of such data; an element 'a priori' that should be considered when drafting the future III PIIA (not yet published or implemented) that aims specifically to the 'cultural diversity management.' Once again, it is clear the straitjacket of the *Junta de Andalucía* regarding its migration policy, imposed by external guidelines and characterised by its lack of medium-term view.

necessary specific actions to integrate some groups of population, consider unnecessary the same actions for other collectives, for the sake of a supposed and alleged sensitivity and openness of the Andalusian society towards those who come to integrate into this society. These double standards are based on the own migratory experience of the Andalusian people themselves.

We left the issue of subvention policies for this section, as the established practices regarding immigration during the last two decades enable us to identify a process in which it is clear that the policy of social intervention towards integration is a bottomless pit of social and economic resources which are absolutely unable to lessen the effects of both a legal state context and a transnational European policy producing social marginalization, for the sake of the main objective of the Euro-Mediterranean countries which is none other than the control of fluxes. From this ethnographic evidence a bleak social landscape in El Ejido is reflected in relation to integration, we can only confirm the worsening social situation of immigrants in comparison with their situation in the late 90's. In this agro-industrial district a 'state of exception' policy on immigration matters has been established, what led to consolidate the 'naturalization' and 'normalization' of all kinds of occupational, residential, educational... segregating practices. It is difficult to address or denounce this situation, due to an existing conflict of interests in the area, even for the minority trade unions that have chosen to distance themselves from the dominant positions of the organizations of employers and major trade unions.

In this context, an intervention policy subject to subventions that are granted to the third sector, universities and municipalities by public consultation in order for them to act on previously established institutional axes, has inevitably tended to favour the strengthening of large specialised and professionalised organizations (this is nothing but an outcome of the lack of integration). Such organizations, in most cases, have a lack of interculturality in relation to their own staff policy and to their labour relations environments that are usually dominated by autochthonous agents, since such a policy is the social product resulting from the absence of integration of the immigrant communities as we have previously discussed.

Not surprisingly the technical and professional specialization in immigration has become a desirable labour and employment niche and a potentially effective means for specialised labour promotion. And of course, it has also become into a handy thematic area for academic production that is well funded by research subsidy policies. That is, around this area of technocratic specialization have been constructed different productive and labour environments characterised by the autochthonous domination minoritising foreigners and their descendents as object/subject of political and

intervention praxis, and as object of study previously silenced by the relation of structural power imposed through the supposed objectivity of a scientific model. On the other hand, in these productive specialised areas in immigration and/or 'work with immigrants' (notice the manipulation in this daily and recurrent expression), begins to cause some direct competition between autochthonous and foreigners who are recently accessing such works, as an attractive niche of specialist employment in the third sector, trade unions and government, since this kind of employment is not subject to the precariousness of the key sectors where immigrants are located through the legislative and political praxis; but also new products made by non-indigenous are starting to emerge in the own specialised thematic field of scientific and technocratic production, although some of them continue reproducing the dominant discourse that objectifies silenced 'otherness', also critical voices emerge questioning and deconstructing starting positions and imaginaries.

This trend has not favoured at all the consolidation of any significant organizational structures promoted by immigrants. Only few organizations at state level like ATIME that are established by collectives with a historical background, as the Moroccan collective, have managed to achieve an institutional and political umbrella allowing them to grow and consolidate. However the most of the organizations can barely subsist in their localities with the grants obtained, and most of them have ended up disappearing after a short time experience. In this panorama, the technocratic discourse of multiculturalism promoted from the specialised spheres is regrettably depleted and dramatically reduced to just an innovative discourse in the shadow of EU policies.

Focusing on the effect on the collectives of immigrants' organizational and political participation activity, on the one hand, it can be argued that the professionalization of the third sector is desirable in order to achieve a greater impact on intervention programs, and in this sense, the policy of public consultation grants or of direct assignment to specific organizations has chosen for the lesser evil option. But on the other hand, it is a fact that impairs the consolidation of emerging organizations. In addition, there is a parallel policy of intervention on public offers for vacancies in programs implemented with public resources which are executed by the third sector, this policy of intervention establishes profiles, conditions, requirements, etc... so it generates a vicious circle which far from promoting multiculturalism and the immigrants professionalization in hegemonic organizations, sets insurmountable obstacles for the immigrants to access to these vacancies. A direct consequence in recent years is the loss of the potential offered by key figures at the community level, and therefore key to social intervention and to have access to minority groups. And lastly, it can also be

argued that this policy has mainly served to consolidate public spaces of political influence from the consolidation of patronage networks of dependency between the third sector hegemonic organizations and the political groups managing the administration.

The main trade unions are often in conflict of interest with their own social foundations. They are the best types of organizations exemplifying a kind of institutional 'intra-role shock'. Hence, they have adopted a clearly deficient role in respect to immigrants' intervention, becoming specialised and in competition with the training and orientation services offered by the third sector. Trade unions also relegate their role of bodies reporting the breaches of labour rights and their activism among immigrant workers. Within the quantitatively major labour market areas of insertion, the grassroots interests of autochthonous and immigrants do not necessarily have to be a conflict when labour insertion takes place in the lower and less qualified strata of the productive system, in which the discourse of the defence of workers in the line of 'normalization' has an egalitarian effect. However, the trade unions' representative role is broken because of the difference of status and interests when the parties in the conflict clash directly with corporate businesses and SMEs.

The protection of multiculturalism and of the free cultural practice and expression of minorities in the areas of employment is relegated into oblivion, given the role that major trade unions play along with the representatives of the CES in the tripartite consultative bodies at the state and regional levels, and taking into account the position adopted by the employers organizations on those issues. That is, belonging to a cultural minority and stating explicitly the differences in the labour ground means entering into a power relationship pre-established in the work contexts. The following opinion of the representative of the Seville Employers Confederation -*Confederación de Empresarios de Sevilla*- CES was stated during an interview and may help us to further illustrate this matter:

Not at all, they are fully integrated, but often the issue of customs, which in the case of companies that are often trying to adapt to those customs, but it is very difficult because if you come from your country of origin is for you to get used to our customs, and this is also my personal opinion, usually there are certain customs or religions that make impossible to carry out a workday, then the immigrants have to be aware that they must accept the rules as a Spanish person. In my case, it's impossible for me to go to pray. Many do not have that problem because they are self-employed and have no problems, they can make the rules they want, but people who come and are recruit by someone else is very difficult for the company, is common sense, you have to provide a customer service, etc.

Moreover, the complaint of local governments seeking public subsidy for positive discrimination programs is recurrent, these programs aim at facing the most difficult situations of immigrants at local level, and it clashes with the position of the appropriate regional administration. These confrontations are interpreted as a lack of commitment of the regional institutions with the local reality that local governments have to face. One of the hot topics is the lack of housing and public shelters policies for temporary workers in agricultural localities. As the urban planning and the housing policy are under local competence, there are claims to the regional administration to intervene in what it is considered a migration issue that lies under regional and state competence. This dispute, which lasts from the 90s, has favoured neither the eradication of spatial segregation nor the solution of the problem of access to decent housing for immigrants living in the localities that are specialised in agricultural production.

Ultimately, it is evident that a European migration policy that hinges on two axes of action has been gradually consolidated over the first decade of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. The first axis is the main pillar of fluxes control and the consolidation of European borders, particularly in the Mediterranean countries. On the other hand, the second axis provides resources for social cohesion, integration of vulnerable collectives and intercultural dialogue between the hegemonic society and the culturally minoritised collectives and, thus, intends to have palliative effects. The influence of this policy at the regional and local level in Andalusia is reflected in the design of a very refined and rather elaborated policy in its discursive level and methodological appearance (we are referring to the design of areas and goals of intervention), although its positive social impact on reality barely exists. This policy has been promoted and launched by a regional government that has sought to support it through social consultation and participation, but it is executed by an autonomous administration that is diminished and anesthetised by state, supranational, corporate and even municipal interests. In short, this is an obvious example of how social policies can become impracticable because of the framework of economic and legal policies structuring the social order.

## **Conclusions**

The impact of the crisis in the immigrant collectives makes of this population a particularly vulnerable group. Social assistance protocols do not apply because of administrations' imperative to any immigrant affected by an undocumented situation, their immigration background does no matter at all. The third sector that before the crisis was supported by the integration policy has reached a situation of operational incapacity, due to budgetary instability and a widespread loss of services, when

addressing the casuistry of needs demanded by the immigrants: psychological care, gender-based violence, family breakdown, young people with school and adaptation problems because of the critical family situation, housing eviction, hunger... A situation that during the last years of economic boom did not affect consolidated and settled collectives and that currently does not make any distinction between recent and well-rooted immigrants who fall into chronic unemployment.

Institutional procedures to intervene on the reinsertion of unemployed workers and on the access to unemployment benefits have established protocols to monitor and to control immigrants in this situation, hindering the development of domestic economic strategies for extensive family networks residing in Spain and/or in their country of origin. An involution process is taking place among the groups that are most affected by chronic unemployment in relation with their family roots and integration situation after a long immigration background. Families are being split up, so that only the strongest and more independent members of the family unit are dedicated to find the incomes at the lowest family burden cost possible, thus the dependent members return to their places of origin. In this sense, family and personal networks are supplying the lack of social institutional coverage and the difficulty to access to resources and social support services. On the other hand, in cases of sustained precariousness, an increase of irregular immigrants with a long migrant background is starting to be common, with the resulting increase of undocumented immigrants. This situation leads to an increase of rootlessness as many immigrants resort to territorial mobility in order to look for temporary jobs; to the loss of basic rights; and to a greater social marginalization in relation with the access to public assistant services and with the inaccessibility or loss of housing.

Strategies and protocols for the implementation of the integration policy in relation with its labour insertion objectives address action axis that prioritise the needs of the hospitality, agriculture and care for dependent labour markets. Concerning the agricultural labour market, employment policies have been approved through the agreement reached with employer organizations and major trade unions using the same rationale, without giving room for any other social participation. These policies set some procedures (salary, hosting, housing agreements) with verifiable local effects of segregation, discrimination, marginalization and ethnicization of the labour market, especially in the cases of recruitments in origin.

Gender inequality within the crisis landscape specially harms immigrant women, in both rural and urban environments, thus the exploitation at lower costs of foreign women, from different national origins, has increase in activities such as domestic service, cleaning, care services, and prostitution. The invisibility of these activities

implies a return to the migration frame of the 90's with the same effects of structural violence suffered by foreign women in Spain during that decade.

Taking into account that the legislation on immigration has as one of its key priorities the fluxes control and the adaptation of immigration to the needs of the labour market at a state level, the employment practices developed under this shadow do not facilitate neither insertion, nor permanence or adaptation to the market requirements, but produces underground activities, such irregular activities are significantly increasing in Andalusia. The context of crisis does not facilitate to keep the residence permit, since specific measures to adapt the law in order to lessen the crisis impact on well-rooted groups are not established.

Control measures in order to cut social welfare spending are developed by putting pressure to the most vulnerable collectives, these are measures of social injustice that increase the risk for the democratic system to lead our societies towards a risky social Darwinism that may affect the social and political stability of the Andalusian localities. Racist episodes of the recent past could re-emerge as an open spigot releasing the dissatisfaction and failure that are affecting a significant percentage of autochthonous population.



## References

- Castaño Madroñal, Ángeles (2003) *Redes sociales y sociabilidad de los inmigrantes marroquíes en Almería*, tesis doctoral, Universidad de Sevilla.
- Castaño Madroñal, Ángeles (2005) 'Las mujeres inmigrantes en Andalucía: inserción laboral, sociabilidad y redes sociales' in Malagón, J.L. y Sarasola, J.L. *Manual de atención social al inmigrante*, Sevilla, Almuzara, 187-210.
- Castaño Madroñal, Ángeles y Manjavacas Ruiz, José María (2006), *Informe 2005 sobre la realidad socioeconómica de la población inmigrante y su inserción sociolaboral en la ciudad de Sevilla*, Ayuntamiento de Sevilla, Sevilla.
- Castaño Madroñal, Ángeles (2009) 'Inserción social y residencialidad de los inmigrantes en las áreas urbanas de Sevilla y el Ejido', *Migraciones Internacionales, contextos y dinámicas territoriales*, Rev. Internacional de Ciencias Sociales Áreas, nº 28, Edit. UM, Universidad de Murcia, 89-102.
- Castaño Madroñal, Ángeles y Bredy, Erica (2011) 'Immigration processes in Seville, the management of diversity and public policies'. Proyecto MIUM-TIE. Managing International Urban Migratio-Turkey, Italia, España. European Commission. External Actions of the European Community: Promotion of the Civil Society Dialogue Between EU and Turkey. (in press)
- Chavis, Benjamin (1991) 'The Historical Significance and Challenges of the First National People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit', *Proceedings of the First National People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit*, United Church of Christ Commission for Racial Justice, Washington, D.C.
- De Lucas, Fernando y De la Cueva, Murillo (2010) 'El tipo antropológico migratorio mediterráneo: ciudadanía a medias'. *Trabajo Social*, nº 12, enero-diciembre 2010, Bogotá, 25-46.
- Di Chiro, Giovanna (1999) 'La justicia social y la justicia ambiental en los Estados Unidos: la naturaleza como comunidad', *Ecología Política*, Barcelona, Icaria, 105-118.

- Finotelli, Claudia (2007) 'Italia, España y el modelo migratorio mediterráneo en el siglo XXI', Área: Demografía, Población y Migraciones Internacionales-ARI Nº 58/2007. Real Instituto Elcano.
- Gil Araujo, Sandra (2004) 'De qué hablan cuando hablan de integración?. Propuesta para el análisis comparado de las políticas de integración e inmigrantes. Los casos de Cataluña y Madrid.' Congreso de Sociología. Alicante. [http://www.fes-web.org/sociopolitica/documentos/VIII\\_congreso\\_FES/gil.pdf](http://www.fes-web.org/sociopolitica/documentos/VIII_congreso_FES/gil.pdf)
- González Enríquez, Carmen (2008) *Los sindicatos ante la inmigración*. OPI, Ministerio de Trabajo e Inmigración.
- Martínez Veiga, Ubaldo (2001), *El Ejido. Discriminación, exclusión social y racismo*. Madrid. Los libros de la Catarata.
- Moreno Navarro, Isidoro (1998) 'Derechos Humanos, Ciudadanía e Interculturalidad' en Emma Martín y Sebastián de la Odra (ed.), *Repensando la Ciudadanía*, Fundación El Monte, Sevilla.
- Moreno Navarro, Isidoro (2006) 'Las viñetas de Mahoma'. [www.mundoarabe.org/mahoma.htm](http://www.mundoarabe.org/mahoma.htm)
- Torres, Francisco (2005) 'La regularización extraordinaria. Luces y sombras', Página Abierta nº 160, junio. <http://www.pensamientocritico.org/fntor0605.htm>.
- VV. AA. (2010) *Living Together: Ciudadanía Europea contra el Racismo y la Xenofobia. Decálogo e Informe Final comparativo y comprehensivo*. Proyecto (JLS/FRC/036). Ministerio de Trabajo e Inmigración. España.
- VV.AA. (2007) *Seminario sobre Políticas Europeas de Migración y Desarrollo*. Cuadernos de Trabajo. FIIAPP, Madrid.